

# Contents

ABBREVIATIONS	2
FOREWORD	5
INTRODUCTION	7
IMPACTS	8
Access and Equity: Leveling the Field for Training and Job Opportunities	8
Poverty Reduction: Trainees Land Jobs and Help Increase Family Incomes	9
The Gender Issue: Women Rise in Economic and Social Status	10
Educational Development:	
Upgrading the Quality of Teaching Staff and Facilities	11
The Environment: Enhanced Awareness	12
LESSONS LEARNED	13
Need for Long-term Investments to be Supported by Ownership and Good Governance	13
A Mismatch in Demand and Supply of Skills:	
The Importance of Linkages to Industry	15
Lack of Monitoring and Coordination in Implementation Causes Delays and Weakens Impact	16
ADB STRENGTHENS LENDING TO EDUCATION	17
At the Policy Level	17
At the Design and Implementation Level: Quality Improvement	18

# Foreword

**T**his digest of evaluation studies in the education sector is the first in the Operations Evaluation Office's (OEO) *Assessing Impact on Development Series*. It provides a summary of issues, lessons, major findings, and conclusions of OEO's recent studies and reports in the sector in reader-friendly format and language. The studies examine the issues contributing to the successes and failures of specific projects. This digest affords another avenue for the understanding of OEO's role in promoting economic and social development within the Asian Development Bank's (ADB) developing member countries through its feedback to ADB operational departments and to executing and implementing agencies. Readers who wish to have more in-depth knowledge of the subsectors discussed here, viz., secondary education, technical education and vocational training, and tertiary education, are invited to access the original studies and reports.

In line with ADB's emphasis on the reduction of poverty, its overarching goal, initiatives have been taken to provide more lending to the social sectors in general, and to education in particular, with strong emphasis on flexibility rather than prescriptive policies and blueprint project designs. And while of late the priority has been accorded to basic education, higher education and skills development are also important if a country's labor force is to increase productivity and acquire new skills, especially in a more competitive and rapidly globalizing environment. The training of teachers is also a crucial require-

ment in light of the equally rapid changes in subject content and methodology. Finally, years of assistance have revealed a critical lesson: in order to succeed, education projects need long-term investments and commitment by both ADB and the developing member countries in a closely coordinated partnership.

While using education as a vehicle to reduce poverty, ADB has unfortunately not increased its investment in education as a percentage of overall lending in the last 30 years. The education sector's cumulative share of ADB's total lending operations in the last three decades is just 5 percent. The track record of the governments is not any better. The population growth rate in the region and the backlog of youth still out of school offer no respite to governments in their quest to provide education for all. The overarching goal of poverty reduction in the region will be best served by increasing investment in education.

Education is one of the most effective ways of addressing poverty. There is a strong reciprocal relationship between poverty and education. Education contributes to improved incomes and thereby to reduction in poverty. Education and income are the twin antidotes to the twin problems of illiteracy and poverty. Breaking the cycle of poverty through education needs a concentration of commitment from both governments and aid agencies.

J.A.M. QUILA  
Chief  
Operations Evaluation Office

**There is a strong reciprocal relationship between poverty and education. Education contributes to improved incomes and thereby to reduction in poverty.**

# Introduction

Since its founding, the Asian Development Bank (ADB) has supported education as a key component in underpinning its mandate to reduce poverty in the region. As of December 2000, ADB had approved a total of 104 projects (115 loans) in the education sector amounting to \$4,547.2 million, of which \$2,602.5 million was from ordinary capital resources and \$1,944.7 million from the Asian Development Fund. Total loans to the education sector account for about 5 percent of total ADB lending since 1968. The investments have made a difference for Asia. The impacts on developing member countries' (DMCs) socioeconomic profiles have been substantial as a result. Education has helped raise the literacy rate among millions of people, especially among disadvantaged groups like rural women and children; it has enhanced training skills; and it has prepared students for the job market. Employment has helped reduce poverty. There is a strong reciprocal relationship between poverty and education. Education contributes to improved incomes and thereby to reduction in poverty. Education and income are the twin antidotes to the twin problems of illiteracy and poverty.

However, years of assistance have revealed a critical lesson: education projects need long-term investments and commitment by both ADB and the DMCs in a closely coordinated partnership in order to succeed. Another equally important realization is the need to balance the focus, particularly to emphasize basic education.

During its early years until the late 1980s, ADB concentrated its assistance on secondary, technical/vocational, and tertiary education. It was only in 1989 that ADB started to give assistance to primary and nonformal education.

Emphasis on basic education is more in keeping with ADB's overarching goal of poverty reduction, as this will address literacy, which is fundamental to socioeconomic upliftment. The 2000-2002 pipeline includes at least 11 basic education projects in 9 DMCs. Whereas the benefits of basic education reach a broad spectrum and have a multiplier effect, investments in vocational and tertiary schools benefit a narrower group of people. Besides, ADB now believes that the private sector should be tapped to support vocational and tertiary education. Project preparation and design have improved substantially, shifting from the blueprint approach of old to that which adopts a flexible process approach, with increasing emphasis on sector work, policy dialogue, participatory approach, and beneficiary consultation. Greater use of more diverse lending modalities, such as the sector development program loan, and advisory technical assistance have gained strategic importance in the improvement of institutions and policy frameworks. A long-term investment strategy, participation of the private sector, and greater collaboration with nongovernment organizations and local communities have now been recognized as necessary to ensure the sustainability of gains achieved under a project.

**Education projects need long-term investments and commitment by both ADB and the developing member countries in a closely coordinated partnership in order to succeed.**

The Operations Evaluation Office (OEO) has undertaken five studies<sup>1</sup> on a number of education subsectors assisted by ADB until the end of the 1980s. These studies—on tertiary, tertiary-level fellowships, vocational and technical training, secondary, and secondary science education projects—examined the issues contributing to the successes and failures of specific education projects. In line with ADB’s emphasis on the poor in the mid-1990s, moves have been made to provide more lending to the basic education sector, with particular emphasis on improved project design and implementation.

Opportunities for education had led to better income levels, and in particular, boosted gender equality.



## Impacts

**S**ocioeconomic improvements as a result of ADB assistance to education are discernible. Opportunities for education have led to better income levels, and in particular, have boosted gender equality. Discussed below are impacts and lessons learned from these studies.

### Access and Equity: Leveling the Field for Training and Job Opportunities

A fundamental approach to these improvements was to equalize access. ADB wanted to give the opportunity for training to the poorest of the poor. Hence, project institutions were selected in key geographical areas. This helped redress regional imbalances in educational opportunities by providing more equitable access to a wide range of economic and demographic backgrounds, especially to low-income families. More than 70 percent of students in technical and vocational courses, for example,

came from the low-income segment. Millions of students benefited from these programs over 15 years.

ADB’s assistance in support of technical education and vocational training (TEVT) was aimed at producing highly trained technicians, skilled workers, and craftsmen to support four DMCs—Malaysia, Pakistan, Papua New Guinea, and Sri Lanka—in their drive toward industrialization.

The Philippines’ Secondary Education Development Sector Project<sup>2</sup> illustrates how widespread the socioeconomic impact was intended. From the fact that the beneficiaries were mainly public secondary schools—75 percent of which were *barangay* or village high schools—the project automatically benefited lower income families. The profile of students showed that 46 percent of their parents were farmers, fishers, or factory/construction workers.

The five studies undertaken by OEO validate the individual findings of the projects covered by the studies that the projects contributed to enhancing distribution and social equity objectives. They had met the demand for education. But while ADB had achieved its objectives in opening up opportunities, the quality of the outcomes was less than expected. The facilities deteriorated the moment the projects were completed. The underutilization, especially of TEVT facilities, is due to lack of operation and maintenance budgetary support resulting in inadequate

<sup>1</sup> PE-530: Secondary Education Development Sector in the Philippines; IE-61: Technical and Vocational Education Projects in Malaysia, Pakistan, Papua New Guinea and Sri Lanka; IE-56: Secondary Science Education Projects in Nepal, Bangladesh and Pakistan; SS-29: Effectiveness and Impact of Training in Education Projects in Indonesia; and IE-22: Bank Operations in the Education Sector in Indonesia.

<sup>2</sup> Loan 898-PHI(SF): Secondary Education Development Sector Project, for \$70 million, approved on 11 August 1988. The loan was closed on 15 November 1995.

instructional staff and consumables. While the projects often exceeded the physical targets, there remains scope for further reducing wastage and improving efficiency.

### Poverty Reduction: Trainees Land Jobs and Help Increase Family Incomes

While the opportunities opened to the poor could be quantified, poverty reduction could not be accurately quantified for the projects evaluated, as the project design in the 1970s and 1980s did not incorporate the necessary measurement tools. Nevertheless, it was evident that there were substantial socioeconomic impacts.

The assistance to the technical and vocational schools successfully prepared the trainees for employment. In Malaysia and Papua New Guinea, about 80 percent found jobs within six months of completing their courses, while in Pakistan and in Sri

Lanka, only 60 and 50 percent, respectively, found jobs within the same period.

Access to high-quality and relevant education and training by the youth was further enhanced by the provision of dormitories and hostels that enabled the families, especially those from remote areas, to save on costs of food and transportation. Thus the ADB's intervention had considerable impact on poverty reduction in addition to meeting the skills requirements of industry.

Impact evaluation studies relating to the different education subsectors in countries like Bangladesh, Indonesia, Malaysia, Nepal, Pakistan, Papua New Guinea, and Sri Lanka have shown a positive correlation between vocational training and employment/career, as well as between the training and socioeconomic improvement of graduates of ADB-assisted schools. Almost 70 percent of Indonesian ADB-assisted technical school graduates found

**In Malaysia and Papua New Guinea, about 80 percent found jobs within six months of completing their courses.**



While female enrollment was formerly concentrated in the “soft” sector—business, commerce, clerical, and secretarial courses—science and technology are equally important today.

jobs, although 52 percent of those employed found their jobs not quite suited to their field of training. The employment prospects were found to be less favorable in the case of vocational school graduates, as about 37 percent of commerce graduates in 1992 had not found jobs while 17 percent had not been employed even after five years.

Due to the weakness in project design, wherein no monitoring mechanism was provided, it can only be assumed that, by the nature of their objectives and purposes, the projects have led to an improvement in the standard of living of the families of graduates. Women’s participation in technical trades has shown an increasing trend, particularly in Papua New Guinea and Sri Lanka. Logically, it can be assumed that the improvement in female literacy rate would have contributed to more women in the labor force and therefore improved family income.

## The Gender Issue: Women Rise in Economic and Social Status

Women were the specific target of the education projects, particularly disadvantaged women in rural areas who had no access to education and training. This was premised on the belief that it is through employment prospects that the impact of enhancing women’s economic and social status would be felt.

The projects in general had significant impact on raising the level of education of women. Enrollment of female students increased substantially in the five categories of education evaluated, except in senior technical schools in Indonesia, where courses are male-oriented.

As a result of the projects, women made up 71 percent of Indonesian vocational schools’ enrollment, and the ratio of female staff to male staff also improved. Vocational schools were found to have helped women



improve their family-owned enterprises. However, female enrollment was concentrated in the “soft” sector, like in business, commerce, clerical, and secretarial courses. Female participation in technology courses was not substantial.

Female student and teacher involvement in TEVT increased significantly over time in the project countries except in Papua New Guinea. The highest level of participation was noted in Sri Lanka, where female students made up 40 percent of total enrollment. The proportion was 30 percent in Malaysia and over 20 percent in Pakistan and Papua New Guinea. It was only in Malaysia where female teachers increased in number. But in Sri Lanka, teaching in vocational and technical schools remained a male-dominated profession.

Female enrollment in secondary science schools in Bangladesh, Nepal, and Pakistan increased by an average of 8.6 percent per year in project schools between 1993 and 1997. The number of female teachers also registered a higher growth rate by 2.7 percent compared with male teachers during 1986-1996.

In many ways, by educating women, the projects helped enhance their participation in the labor force, as well as the image and status of rural women. Improvement in women’s education, postponement of marriage, and implementation of family planning have contributed to an increase in the number of women entering the industry and service sectors. This has resulted in greater gender equality.

### **Educational Development: Upgrading the Quality of Teaching Staff and Facilities**

The ADB assistance to DMCs generated improvements in facilities and the quality of teaching staff. The projects often exceeded the physical targets, in that equip-

ment, textbooks, and school buildings were sufficiently provided.

Physical improvements normally led to an upward trend in enrollment. In Indonesia, an initial problem with dropout rates was corrected in the early stages of the projects. The dropout rate at the Surabaya Institute of Technology plummeted from 10 percent to 2 percent, while it fell to 1 percent at the University of Hasanuddin. Nevertheless, dropout and retention rates were still substantial in all Indonesian institutions, suggesting that there was scope for further reducing wastage and improving efficiency. The student-teacher ratio, however, improved across the board in vocational and technical institutes and universities.

The quality of teaching staff in degree programs took a quantum leap during and after the projects’ implementation. The Surabaya Institute of Technology, for example, recorded a jump in percentage of teachers with postgraduate qualifications from 4.6 percent at appraisal to 31 percent in 1993. Similarly, at the University of Hasanuddin, the staff with postgraduate qualifications shot up from 6.1 percent at appraisal to 35 percent in 1991/1992.

**Not only did the science projects make a significant impact in enhancing institutional capacities for science education, but they also resulted in a network of science education centers that served as major resource centers.**



Given the long development cycle needed for education, a series of improving overlapping projects with consistent core objectives to stretch over at least a decade is needed to make any sustainable impact.

The Philippine secondary school project assisted 673 schools throughout the country, accounting for 20 percent of all public high schools. It added 216,000 seats in the schools and helped accommodate 24 percent of the increased enrollment in public high schools. Millions of textbooks were produced and distributed, dramatically increasing the textbook/student ratio from one book for every seven students in 1986 to two books for every three students in 1992. Over 130,000 teachers and principals were trained.

The secondary science education projects brought about an awareness of science in Bangladesh, Nepal, and Pakistan. In Bangladesh, there was no science education in rural schools before the ADB project began. Not only did the science projects make a significant impact in enhancing institutional capacities for science education, but they also resulted in a network of science education centers that served as major resource centers.

While quantity exceeded expectations in most education projects, quality was wanting. Enrollment grew fast, but the projects, in an apparent oversight, were not designed to improve classroom efficiency. The secondary science education projects were not able to address the large average class size, overly heavy teaching load, and the high-stakes external examinations that engendered rote learning among students to the detriment of practical experience. It was also observed that in-service teacher training at the secondary level was hurried and uneven, without proper incentives or a merit system for potential teacher candidates. Advancement in education, particularly in Pakistan, was seniority based and depended largely on the ability of the teachers to teach higher classes and assume supervisory and administrative posts. Furthermore, it was noted that teachers in science schools were forced to moonlight in other

jobs to augment their low salaries. The result was that there was no significant difference in science learning between the graduates of project and nonproject schools.

The inefficient classroom situation in secondary level technical and vocational institutions was similar. Industry-linked training and upgrading of staff were insufficient. Graduates and employees interviewed for the impact studies felt the practical courses needed to be expanded at the tertiary and secondary levels as the teachers had limited exposure to industry-based training and changes in modern technology. A large number still had no industrial experience or pedagogical training and lacked technical knowledge and practical training in the operation of major equipment procured under the projects.

### The Environment: Enhanced Awareness

Assistance to the education sector had no adverse impact on the environment. Environmental impact was not factored in during project preparation. Nevertheless, the secondary science education projects had the most impact on environment issues in the curricula. The impact was indirect, but positive.

The curricula at various levels gave emphasis to environmental education, including topics on the ecosystem, conservation of natural resources, and personal and community hygiene. The ADB-assisted projects had built-in mechanisms to inculcate in the youth and other community members environmental consciousness and its effect on health and economic activity. Consistent with this thrust, the teachers' and administrators' training programs gave equal importance to environmental education to enable the participants to handle these topics in the curriculum.



## Lessons Learned

**M**any useful lessons have been gleaned from the less than expected results of ADB assistance to the education sector. A few of the more significant are discussed below.

### Need for Long-term Investments to be Supported by Ownership and Good Governance

It became very clear from experience that all education projects need long-term investments: a one-off project does not work. Given the long development cycle needed

for improving education, a series of overlapping projects with consistent core objectives to stretch over at least a decade is needed to make any sustainable impact. Future projects need to focus on the long-term nature of changes initiated, as well as to have a realistic assessment of the executing agency's commitment to reforms and its financial capacity to sustain them. Work on a long-term strategic framework for overall ADB operations, which ensures that activities are integrated and directed towards the overarching goal of reducing poverty, has started.

Aware that there is no sufficient local capacity to sustain the projects on a long-term basis, foreign funding agencies should consider a sequence of projects in order to support the improvements over an extended timeframe. Unless the beneficiary countries demonstrate strong governance

**Aware that there is no sufficient local capacity to sustain the projects on a long-term basis, foreign funding agencies should consider a sequence of projects in order to support the improvements over an extended timeframe.**

Maintaining good quality and relevance in technical education requires continuous adjustment measures to keep abreast of progress in industry, technology, and training practices.



and their interest as stakeholders, ADB projects are going to degenerate soon after completion, as indeed many have. This emphasizes the need for policy dialogue and capacity building.

On one hand, Malaysia shines as the sole success story and has demonstrated its commitment to sustain project outcomes, the result of its quality governance, and a sense of ownership. This was because the Government had an agenda to harness education to propel the country to newly industrializing economy status. The Government had the political will to use the assistance, and it set aside resources to sustain the benefits after project completion. Hence ADB-assisted assets remain in good condition in Malaysia.

On the other hand, in other countries most of the projects degenerated after completion from lack of attention and sustained investments. The Philippines secondary school project was one example.

The state of secondary education has deteriorated since the project was completed in 1992. Gains in quality improvement, efficiency, and access were not sustained due to government budgetary constraints.

Similar deterioration in the other education projects such as those for secondary science and vocational and technical schools added up to suggest a lack of commitment in the DMCs. As a result, momentum was lost, and some physical assets and human resources assigned to the projects remained grossly underutilized. Any follow-up project after a lapse of 2-4 years required a costly restart of activities. Hence governments need to continue investing to sustain projects after the ADB has completed its task.

Beyond funding problems, governance and a sense of ownership of the projects were largely missing, thus lowering the chances of success. Some project institutions performed better than others, and

this could be traced to leadership, which spelled the difference. Most of the institutions in DMCs operate in a highly centralized and bureaucratic environment, and are vulnerable to political pressures.

While all project schools suffered the same constraints such as inadequate budgets, poor physical facilities, and political pressures, quality leadership of the institutions was critical to success. Political consideration played a role in selecting some of the school heads as well as the school sites. This did not ensure quality. Depoliticizing the selection of project director or school head and other managers would increase the chance of success of projects.

The beneficiaries, on the other hand, need to be brought into the consultation process. Only when they are convinced that they have a stake in the projects and will look after them, will the success be further ensured, as Malaysia has shown.

### A Mismatch in Demand and Supply of Skills: The Importance of Linkages to Industry

Leadership also requires that school administrators be attuned to the job market. Maintaining good quality and relevance in technical education requires continuous adjustment measures to keep abreast of progress in industry, technology, and training practices. This includes curriculum revision; establishment of mechanisms to evaluate teaching standards, student achievement, and the relevance of programs to the needs of industry; and increased involvement of industry in the technical education institutions. Experience proved that the lack of job opportunities for vocational school graduates was due to a mismatch in the demand and supply of skills. The sole use of manpower forecasts proved to be an unreliable tool for project identification and appraisal.

Rather, development needs demand that labor market analyses and market-oriented measures of skills demand and supply be adopted.

The mindset that education is to meet the demands of “social safety nets,” i.e., providing education to the poor regardless of quality and industry demand, needs to be reoriented. It would be imprudent to



In the last 10 years, basic education was allocated the largest share at 41 percent; secondary education, 23 percent; TEVT down to 14 percent; and higher education, 13 percent.

ignore market signals in examining investment options. It is important that the content of vocational programs as well as the selection of courses be carefully reviewed to adjust policies in line with emerging development needs.

Experience also clearly showed that assistance to schools without industry linkage is untenable. The polytechnics of Pakistan and technical colleges of Papua New Guinea and Sri Lanka operated in isolation. So did the five project institutions in Indonesia. This deprived them of valuable inputs such as industry exposure to students and teachers alike, and a built-in feedback mechanism on the type, level, and quality of personnel needed. Future projects should engage industries as major stakeholders in the development of technical, vocational, and tertiary training.

A good start was made in Indonesia in this area. In order to draw the schools closer to industry, the Indonesian Government was encouraged to motivate the private sector, through tax relief, to help improve the facilities in private schools, to help in industry-oriented training, and to absorb them into private industries.

## Lack of Monitoring and Coordination in Implementation Causes Delays and Weakens Impact

In assessing the many lessons learned, it is evident that monitoring is a key issue. Many projects suffered from poor management during implementation. As a result of delays, the activities could not flow in a systematic order. For example, teacher training came ahead of the new curriculum, and equipment (which could have been used in the training) was delivered long after the teacher training stage. The Philippine project experienced poor quality procurement and civil works. In all instances costs shot up and the project impact was reduced.

To help minimize delays in future projects, the following lessons were noted: (i) the need for the prompt selection of a project director and other key positions with long-term tenure; (ii) well-defined guidelines, granting a certain degree of operational autonomy to regional and provincial units, which is a particularly important consideration in a federal set-up such as Pakistan; and (iii) training project staff to be familiar with ADB financial systems and procedures to facilitate project processing.

Monitoring was also weak in curricula upgrading. Project monitoring units were found to be detached from what was going on in the classroom in the secondary science education projects. There was no periodic data gathering to indicate if the intended curriculum was being implemented. The absence of such real-time feedback deprived project management of the opportunity to correct the mistakes in midstream. It was a serious shortcoming.

There is a need for greater coordination (among agencies) and decentralization (to the provincial level) of human



resource planning to ensure the relevance of training provided in technical schools to industry and local community needs. Human resource planning strategies need to adopt labor market analyses, including market-based assessment of skill demand and supply.

## ADB Strengthens Lending to Education

**M**any shortcomings became obvious in subsequent evaluation of the projects. Since the mid-1990s, ADB has made efforts to correct the weaknesses found at the policy level, design and implementation stage, and postcompletion stage. Paramount to the strengthening of its lending policy is the installation of a monitoring system.

### At the Policy Level

**Basic education gets priority:** The education portfolio has shifted to a more balanced lending program, with emphasis on basic education. Between 1970 and 1990, about half of ADB loans to the education sector were allocated to TEVT, about 30 percent to higher education, 10 percent to secondary education, and only 10 percent to basic education. In the last 10 years, basic education was allocated the largest share at 41 percent; secondary education, 23 percent; TEVT down to 14 percent; and higher education, 13 percent.



Basic education includes primary education, with girls' and women's education receiving more attention. The first Primary Education for Girls Project in Pakistan in 1989 was the watershed.

**Long-term perspective:** Investment in the sector is now suggested to be through a series of three or four projects supporting a set of core objectives in DMCs. Four recent loans to Pakistan and Bangladesh embody the new outlook. Work on a long-term strategic framework for overall ADB operations, which will ensure that activities are integrated and directed towards the overarching goal of reducing poverty, has started. An *Education Sector Policy Paper*, being prepared in parallel, highlights the need for a long-term investment strategy in each subsector.



**The sector development loan:** Aside from the conventional project and sector loans, the sector development program (SDP) modality has recently been added and has been used in Indonesia, Kyrgyz Republic, and Mongolia. The SDP is a blend of policy and project lending that involves policy reforms in exchange for a quick-disbursing program loan, while a parallel project loan provides the funding for a particular project related to the policy change.

### At the Design and Implementation Level: Quality Improvement

**Coordination and project preparation:** There is now increased focus on ensuring that ADB assistance is consistent with its

own country operational strategy, the country assistance plan, and the beneficiary country's national development goals. Policy dialogue is an important ingredient.

There is emphasis on strengthening institutional capacity and project ownership by executing agencies. This is done through using the participatory approach in planning and consultation with beneficiaries, policy advice and technical support, and a shift in project content bias from hardware (physical infrastructure, equipment) to software (teacher training, curriculum development, planning and management, and institutional capacity building).

**Loan administration and monitoring:** More balanced emphasis is now given between project processing and loan administration. More resources for budget, staff,

and management supervision are now provided for loan administration. There is now mandatory use of the midterm review in addition to regular annual reviews. Since 1995, a project performance management system (PPMS) has been developed for an improved approach to monitor all stages of project design and implementation, as well as development results.

The mandatory use of a framework for measurable performance indicators and the project performance report, as well as the active participation of the DMCs' executing agencies in providing the monitoring information, are key aspects of the PPMS. An online database now provides real-time feedback for close monitoring.

ADB recognizes that to strengthen education and ensure the sustainability of gains achieved under its investments requires greater collaboration with its partners in development and the beneficiaries. The private sector, nongovernment organizations, and local communities, who are ultimately the beneficiaries, are now active participants in ADB education projects.

## ADB ASSISTANCE TO THE EDUCATION SECTOR BY COUNTRY

As of 31 December 2000

### A. Loans

Country	No. of Loans	Amount (\$ million)	Percent
Bangladesh	12	498.250	11.0
Bhutan	1	7.130	0.2
Cambodia	2	40.000	0.9
Cook Islands	1	2.700	0.1
Indonesia	29	1,992.350	43.8
Kazakhstan	3	65.000	1.4
Korea, Republic of	2	56.700	1.2
Kyrgyz Republic	3	57.700	1.3
Lao PDR	3	53.300	1.2
Malaysia	5	258.800	5.7
Maldives	1	6.300	0.1
Marshall Islands	2	14.825	0.3
Mongolia	2	15.500	0.3
Nepal	5	56.100	1.2
Pakistan	10	499.100	11.0
Papua New Guinea	4	55.900	1.2
Philippines	8	251.931	5.5
Samoa	1	7.000	0.2
Singapore	2	22.000	0.5
Sri Lanka	8	199.900	4.4
Thailand	5	160.720	3.5
Uzbekistan	3	97.000	2.1
Viet Nam	3	129.000	2.8
<b>Total</b>	<b>115</b>	<b>4,547.206</b>	<b>100.0</b>

continued on page 20

continued from page 19

## B. Technical Assistance

Country	No. of TA Projects	Amount (\$ million)	Percent
Afghanistan	1	0.097	0.1
Bangladesh	24	13.808	14.4
Bhutan	5	1.645	1.7
Cambodia	11	6.326	6.6
China, People's Rep. of	5	2.500	2.6
Cook Islands	2	0.647	0.7
India	1	0.000	0.0
Indonesia	37	13.158	13.7
Kazakhstan	3	1.595	1.7
Kiribati	1	0.150	0.2
Korea, Republic of	2	0.175	0.2
Kyrgyz Republic	4	3.030	3.1
Lao PDR	16	7.568	7.9
Malaysia	3	1.068	1.1
Maldives	5	2.195	2.3
Marshall Islands	2	0.326	0.3
Micronesia, Fed. States	2	0.595	0.6
Mongolia	6	2.655	2.8
Myanmar	1	0.190	0.2
Nepal	12	5.245	5.5
Pakistan	17	4.087	4.2
Papua New Guinea	5	1.699	1.8
Philippines	17	7.989	8.3
Samoa	2	0.970	1.0
Singapore	1	0.543	0.6
Solomon Islands	1	0.250	0.3
Sri Lanka	15	5.278	5.5
Thailand	8	3.481	3.6
Uzbekistan	8	3.300	3.4
Vanuatu	2	0.325	0.3
Viet Nam	9	5.299	5.5
<b>Total</b>	<b>228</b>	<b>96.194</b>	<b>100.0</b>

## C. Regional Technical Assistance (RETA)

Type of RETA	No. of RETAs	Amount (\$ million)	Percent
Training	12	3.877	39.9
Conference	9	1.779	18.3
Study	7	3.310	34.1
Research	2	0.750	7.7
<b>Total</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>9.716</b>	<b>100.0</b>

# Operations Evaluation Office

The Operations Evaluation Office is responsible for administering ADB's independent operations evaluation functions, which aim to (i) improve the design and execution of ADB's future activities in light of the lessons learned from its operations, and (ii) enable ADB to account to its shareholders for the effectiveness of its development assistance to its DMCs. A major activity of the Office is the preparation of project and program performance audit reports (PPARs) of completed projects/programs for which project/program completion reports have been prepared by the operational departments responsible for project/program processing and implementation. PPARs involve the comprehensive evaluation of project/program effectiveness in achieving objectives and provide analytical commentary focusing on lessons of operational significance. OEO also undertakes various intensive studies of broader relevance to ADB's operations, such as technical assistance performance audit reports, impact assessment and special evaluation studies, reevaluation studies, and country assistance program evaluation. To ensure the usefulness of operations evaluation, the Office provides effective feedback of lessons learned into the operational system of ADB through several channels, including the computerized operations evaluation information system, the annual review of evaluation operations, country/sector syntheses of operations evaluation findings, and feedback sessions with operational departments. OEO also prepares, in cooperation with operational departments and offices concerned, a review of the annual performance evaluation program, which brings together all activities related to project performance and, therefore, improves feedback inputs into project preparation and implementation. Through technical assistance, the Office also assists DMCs in developing and strengthening their independent evaluation capabilities.