

# **Gender Equality Results in ADB Projects**

Nepal Country Report

# **GENDER EQUALITY RESULTS IN ADB PROJECTS**

## **NEPAL COUNTRY REPORT**

Juliet Hunt  
Shireen Lateef  
Ava Shrestha

**Poverty Reduction and Social Development Division  
Regional and Sustainable Development Department  
Asian Development Bank**

**April 2005**

For permission to photocopy or reprint any part of this work, please send a request with complete information to the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA, telephone 978-750-8400, fax 978-750-4470, [www.copyright.com](http://www.copyright.com).

All other queries on rights and licenses, including subsidiary rights, should be addressed to the Office of External Relations, Asian Development Bank, 6 ADB Avenue, Mandaluyong City, 1550 Metro Manila, Philippines  
Tel (63-2) 632-4444  
Fax (63-2) 632-2444  
[www.adb.org](http://www.adb.org)

© 2005 Asian Development Bank  
All rights reserved. Published 2005.  
Printed in the Philippines.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data Available  
Publication Stock No. 040705

The views expressed in this book are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views and policies of the Asian Development Bank or its Board of Governors or the governments that either represents.

The Asian Development Bank does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this publication and accept no responsibility for any consequence of their use.

Use of the term “country” does not imply any judgment by the author or the Asian Development Bank to the legal or other status of any territorial entity.

## **Acknowledgements**

This report is one of a series of four country reports and one synopsis report presenting findings of rapid gender assessments of selected ADB-financed loan projects under implementation in four developing member countries: Bangladesh, Cambodia, Nepal, and Pakistan. The studies were undertaken as part of ADB's review of the implementation of its gender and development policy to determine whether inclusion of project gender action plans and strategies improved project implementation, outreach, and results for women.

The authors wish to acknowledge their appreciation for the assistance provided by staff, consultants, and project team members working on the projects included in this assessment, including those from the Ministry of Agriculture and Co-operatives and the Department of Livestock Services, the Ministry of Education and Sports, the National Centre for Education Development, the Ministry of Finance, the Ministry of General Administration, and the Ministry of Women, Children, and Social Welfare in Nepal. Other agencies including other donors and NGOs also assisted.

Thanks are also due to the Nepal Resident Mission staff, especially to the Nepal Country Director Sultan Hafeez Rahman and his team for their encouragement and support. Judy Goldman provided editing assistance and Bong Reclamado provided production assistance.

## Acronyms and abbreviations

ADB	—	Asian Development Bank
CBO	—	community-based organization
CLDP	—	Community Livestock Development Project
CMC	—	citizen monitoring cell
CSSP	—	Civil Society Support Project
DLS	—	Department of Livestock Services
DLSO	—	District Livestock Service Office
EFA	—	Education For All
GAD	—	gender and development
GAP	—	gender action plan
GRCU	—	Governance and Reform Coordination Unit
GRP	—	Governance Reform Program
JT	—	junior technician
JTA	—	junior technical assistant
LAT	—	livestock action team
LIRA	—	Livestock Industry Related Association
MOAC	—	Ministry of Agriculture and Co-operatives
MOES	—	Ministry of Education and Sports
MOF	—	Ministry of Finance
MOGA	—	Ministry of General Administration
MOH	—	Ministry of Health
MOWCSW	—	Ministry of Women, Children and Social Welfare
NASC	—	Nepal Administrative Staff College
NCED	—	National Centre for Education Development
NGO	—	nongovernment organization
NRs	—	Nepalese rupees
PSC	—	public service commission
PTTC	—	primary teacher training center
RGA	—	rapid gender assessment
RRP	—	report and recommendation of the President (ADB)
SMC	—	school management committee
SSG	—	school support group
TEP	—	Teacher Education Project
TLDP	—	Third Livestock Development Project
UNDP	—	United Nations Development Programme
VAHW	—	village animal health worker
WDO	—	women development officers, district level

### **CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS**

Currency Unit — Nepalese Rupee  
US\$1.00 = Approximately 73.4 Nepalese  
Rupees

### **NOTE**

In this report, "\$" refers to US dollars.

# Table of Contents

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....ix**

## **I. INTRODUCTION**

A. Background ..... 1  
B. Study Objectives and Scope ..... 1  
C. Methodology ..... 2  
D. Fieldwork for the Nepal Rapid Gender Assessment ..... 3

## **II. THIRD LIVESTOCK DEVELOPMENT PROJECT**

A. Project Description..... 5  
B. Gender Analysis and Provisions Included in the Loan Design ..... 6  
C. Development of a Gender Action Plan during Loan Implementation..... 7  
D. Discussion of Achievements and Results..... 8  
    1. Individual and Household Benefits ..... 8  
    2. Community Benefits ..... 12  
    3. Sustainability..... 12  
    4. Contribution of Gender Provisions and Results to Poverty Reduction ..... 13  
    5. Institutional Impacts..... 13  
E. Challenges ..... 14  
F. Factors Influencing the Achievement of Gender Equality Results ..... 15  
    1. Effectiveness of the Gender Action Plan ..... 15  
    2. Institutional Factors..... 16  
G. Recommendations ..... 16

## **III. GOVERNANCE REFORM PROGRAM**

A. Project Description..... 19  
B. Gender Provisions Included in the Loan Design.....20  
C. Discussion of Achievements and Progress.....21  
    1. Loan Conditions Leverage High-Level Support for Gender Equality ..... 22  
    2. Community Benefits ..... 22  
    3. Sustainability..... 26  
    4. Contribution of Gender Provisions to Overall Loan Objectives .....26  
D. Challenges ..... 27  
E. Factors Influencing the Achievement of Gender Equality Results .....28  
F. Recommendations ..... 28

## **IV. TEACHER EDUCATION PROJECT**

A. Project Description..... 31  
B. Social and Gender Analysis and Provisions Included in the Loan Design ..... 32

C.	Discussion of Achievements and Progress.....	33
1.	Individual and Community Benefits .....	34
2.	Sustainability.....	36
3.	Contribution of Gender Provisions to Overall Loan Objectives .....	36
D.	Factors Influencing the Achievement of Gender Equality Results .....	37
E.	Recommendations .....	37

## V. FINDINGS

A.	Approaches to Addressing Gender Equality .....	41
B.	Summary of Gender Equality Results Achieved.....	42
C.	The Effectiveness of Gender Action Plans and Gender Strategies .....	43
1.	Linking Gender Strategies to Project Objectives .....	44
2.	Ownership of Gender Strategies .....	44
3.	Good Gender Analysis .....	44
4.	Realistic and Mandatory Targets, Monitoring and Loan Covenants.....	44
5.	Capacity for Gender-Sensitive Development in Executing Agencies.....	45
D.	The Role of Local Gender Specialists.....	45
E.	Other External and Institutional Factors .....	46

## VI. CONCLUSIONS..... 47

### TEXT BOXES AND TEXT TABLE

Box 1:	Third Livestock Development Project: Summary of Gender Equality Results .....	9
Box 2:	Third Livestock Development Project: Recommendations.....	17
Box 3:	Governance Reform Program: Summary of Gender Equality Results .....	23
Box 4:	Governance Reform Program: Recommendations .....	29
Box 5:	Teacher Education Project: Summary of Gender Equality Results .....	35
Box 6:	Teacher Education Project: Recommendations.....	38
Table:	Percentage of Women in the Civil Service (1978 – 2004).....	25

### APPENDIXES

#### 1. Summaries of Gender Provisions and Results

<b>Table 1:</b>	Gender Strategies, Provisions and Gender Equality Results for the Third Livestock Development Project .....	49
<b>Table 2:</b>	Gender Provisions and Progress toward Gender Equality Results for the Governance Reform Program .....	55
<b>Table 3:</b>	Gender Provisions and Progress toward Gender Equality Results for the Teacher Education Project .....	66

<b>2.</b>	<b>Interviews and Meetings for Nepal’s Rapid Gender Assessment.....</b>	<b>73</b>
<b>3.</b>	<b>Teacher Education Project: Public Primary Teachers in 12 Targeted Districts.....</b>	<b>76</b>
<b>4.</b>	<b>Documents Reviewed for Nepal’s Rapid Gender Assessment</b>	
	Third Livestock Development Project .....	77
	Governance Reform Program .....	78
	Teacher Education Project .....	78
	Other Documents .....	79

# Executive Summary

## Rapid Gender Assessments

Rapid gender assessments of 12 loans in four countries (Bangladesh, Cambodia, Nepal, and Pakistan) were undertaken as part of the Asian Development Bank's (ADB) review of the implementation of its gender and development policy adopted in 1998. The aim was to determine whether project-specific gender action plans (GAPs) and strategies improved project implementation, outreach, and results for women. Each country assessment reviewed a total of three loans selected from the agriculture, rural development, governance, and human development/social (health or education) sectors.

This report is one of a series of four country reports that assesses results in the following areas: participation in project activities; access to resources; practical benefits delivered to women; and changes in gender relations at individual, household, or community levels. A report synthesizing findings from all four countries compares results and summarizes lessons. Findings in all four countries concluded that project GAPs resulted in better outreach to women, improved participation and benefits, and progress towards gender equality.

The three loan projects assessed in Nepal were:

- Loan 1461-NEP: Third Livestock Development Project (TLDP) approved September 1996 for \$18.3 million;
- Loan 1861-NEP: Governance Reform Program (GRP) approved November 2001 for \$30 million;
- Loan 1840-NEP: Teacher Education Project (TEP) approved September 2001 for \$25.9 million.

TLDP developed a GAP following the mid-term review that included gender strategies for most project components and extensive capacity building of executing agency staff and local stakeholders in gender-responsive planning and implementation. In contrast, TEP had no formal GAP though the design included a separate component to address the inequalities faced by girls and disadvantaged groups in gaining access to education and significant gender strategies in some components. However, gender strategies were ill defined in the loan design, targets for female participation in project activities were not systematically set, and loan assurances were not directly linked with gender strategies.

GRP is a policy-based loan focusing on public sector reforms. GRP also did not have a formal GAP, but the loan design included significant gender provisions to increase women's

representation in the civil service that were linked to tranche release policy conditions. However, opportunities were missed in the identification of gender issues in other components, and follow-up during implementation has been less than optimal.

## **Results for Nepal**

### **1. GAPS are an effective tool for gender mainstreaming.**

Because of its GAP, TLDP took a more systematic and comprehensive approach to addressing gender equality and achieved the most comprehensive results including both practical benefits for women and strategic changes in gender relations. TEP and GRP, on the other hand, were characterized by more limited gender analyses and a more ad hoc or piecemeal approach to gender strategies because no GAP was developed during loan design or implementation.

The RGA demonstrates the importance of including GAPS or gender strategies to promote and ensure the implementation of the gender mainstreaming features of loan projects. They also provide implementation road maps for executing agencies and project teams. To increase effectiveness, GAPS and gender strategies should be re-visited early in implementation so they can be refined and updated as necessary.

### **2. GAPS produce better results for women.**

TLDP's GAP focused on increasing women's participation in mixed and all-female livestock enterprise groups, involving women in all project training activities, and on gender sensitization and social mobilization. As a result, women's participation in farmer groups increased from 26% in 1999 to 51% in 2004 offering them greater access to project resources such as training and technology that in turn yielded better livelihood options, increased incomes (women who previously earned little or no income now earn income from goat sales), reduced workloads due to technical improvements with fodder, and increased financial security from group savings schemes. Women are now accepted as members of livestock groups and play a greater role in family decision making and in district livestock planning. They are also more likely to take collective action to solve community problems through their membership in women's groups.

TEP has achieved reasonable levels of participation by women in in-service training, and women from disadvantaged and ethnic groups have gained access to resources through scholarships though further work is required to ensure that this translates into increased employment in rural areas as teachers. TEP's most significant achievement is the development of a 2-day gender and cultural sensitization training package and the inclusion of gender and social equity issues in teacher training curricula. This has the potential to reinforce positive changes in gender relations. A GAP should be formulated as soon as possible with input from the ADB resident mission gender specialist to maximize benefits from this investment. TEP's mid-term review presents an important opportunity to assess gender benefits and to introduce mid-course corrections to the project design.

While GRP did not include a formal GAP, it has elevated and firmly secured gender equality as part of policy dialogue on the governance reform agenda. This in itself is a major achievement. GRP is a good example of linking gender equality policy conditions to tranche releases in policy/program loans. Government approval of an affirmative action policy to increase the representation of women in the civil service, including at senior levels, was the main gender-related policy condition. To date there has been virtually no progress on this issue. The cabinet's recent approval of a reservation policy for the civil service has the potential to accelerate progress and to build an enabling environment for future strategic changes in gender relations. However, further gender strategies and indicators should be identified for civil service performance management and improvement at local levels.

**3. GAPS help to achieve overall loan objectives, sustainable results, and institutional change.**

TLDP's GAP significantly strengthened the project's focus on poverty reduction by increasing the livelihood options and the financial security of not only poor women but also of other disadvantaged groups. Furthermore, it had broader institutional and policy impacts. There now is a willingness to target women and to institutionalize gender mainstreaming approaches in the Department of Livestock Services. The project's success provided a powerful rationale for the executing agency to replicate GAP strategies in non-TLDP areas and to apply lessons learned and replicate the design in the follow-on loan for the Community Livestock Development Project. All these features enhance the sustainability of gender equality and poverty reduction results.

**4. Realistic and mandatory targets, monitoring, and loan covenants should be included in gender strategies and action plans.**

Gender strategies and plans need to include quantifiable targets and strategies for each component with gender-inclusive monitoring indicators that are integrated into project frameworks and supported by loan covenants. These features ensure systematic implementation of the gender-design features of the projects and deliver improved results. They also increase the likelihood of monitoring, which is essential for the development and review of appropriate gender strategies. Loan conditions have helped to keep gender equality issues on the agenda in GRP where internal stakeholder commitment and ownership is low or mixed. However, TEP demonstrates that covenants need to be directly linked to gender strategies for them to be most useful. Both TEP and GRP demonstrate the importance of systematic follow-up by both the executing agency and ADB to ensure that gender provisions are implemented, whether or not they are linked to loan covenants.

**5. Gender specialists play important roles.**

Findings indicate that the ADB resident mission gender specialist should be closely involved in both the design and implementation of projects, particularly where ownership and the capacity to develop appropriate gender strategies are limited. The involvement of the ADB gender specialist was a key factor for improving the quality of loan design (GRP) and implementation (TLDP) through provision of technical advice in the development of gender action plans, capacity building, and ongoing support for the implementation of gender plans and strategies.

In TLDP, capacity was significantly enhanced by the appointment of a local gender specialist in the executing agency who worked with stakeholders at many different levels. This contrasts with the experience in GRP where gender focal points have been appointed, but their roles are unclear and they have limited capacity and inadequate resources. Establishing a gender unit in the Civil Society Support Program of GRP would strengthen the monitoring of gender mainstreaming initiatives.

## **6. Other factors can influence the achievement of gender equality results.**

Comprehensive gender analyses are needed to identify constraints to women's participation in project activities and to systematically develop gender strategies to address these constraints across all components. This is a strength in TLDP's GAP but a weakness in GRP and TEP where gender issues still need to be addressed.

In TLDP, committed, stable leadership and good management in the Department of Livestock Services were keys to success. Project management was characterized by teamwork, good communication, support for the gender specialist, encouragement for all staff to reflect on strengths and shortcomings, and a capacity to learn from experience and adapt strategies to improve project outcomes.

Ownership of gender strategies was another reason for TLDP's success. It was a result of the participatory and flexible approach used in developing the GAP. Ownership is one of the challenges in GRP where it appears that some stakeholders do not understand the links between a gender responsive civil service, good governance, and local delivery of equal benefits and services.

All three projects and executing agencies need to improve monitoring of participation and benefits, including the collection, reporting, and analysis of sex-disaggregated data. Project frameworks currently give inadequate attention to gender-sensitive indicators. This increases the risk that differences between women's and men's participation and benefits will be poorly monitored. ADB loan review missions also need to systematically investigate and analyze differences in participation and benefits. Another important challenge is to move beyond monitoring of gender balance and participation to monitoring and assessing results and outcomes such as practical benefits to women and men and positive changes in gender relations.

## *Chapter 1*

# Introduction

### **A. Background**

The Asian Development Bank's (ADB) 1998 policy on gender and development (GAD) adopted gender mainstreaming as a key strategy for addressing gender inequality and the empowerment of women in all ADB-financed activities.<sup>1</sup> A number of institutional mechanisms have been adopted to ensure policy implementation including the appointment of local gender specialists in six ADB resident missions<sup>2</sup> and the development of specific gender action plans (GAPs)/gender strategies for several loan projects. Some of these GAPs/strategies were developed during loan design and were included as an appendix to the report and recommendation to the President (RRP) of ADB and were supported by loan assurances/covenants. Others were developed during implementation as part of mid-course corrections.<sup>3</sup> GAPs may include strategies for increasing the participation of and benefits to women during implementation, targets, activities, time-bound actions, monitoring indicators, project gender specialists, and budgets.

The assumption is that GAPs encourage a more systematic and integrated approach to addressing gender in project design and implementation, including monitoring the implementation of gender design features, benefits, and results for women and men. To test this assumption, 12 rapid gender assessments (RGAs) of loan projects under implementation were conducted in Bangladesh, Cambodia, Nepal, and Pakistan as part of ADB's overall review of the implementation of its GAD policy. Reports were prepared for each country along with a report that consolidates findings from all 12 RGAs.

### **B. Study Objective and Scope**

The objective of the RGAs is to assess whether the introduction of project-specific GAPs and strategies improved implementation, outreach, and results for women. The RGAs focus on:

- who participates in major project activities, including who has access to project resources;
- benefits for females and males including differences in results between males and females;

---

<sup>1</sup> ADB. 1998. Policy on Gender and Development.

<sup>2</sup> Ibid and ADB. 2002. *Interim Progress Report on the Policy on Gender and Development*.

<sup>3</sup> Ibid.

## 2 *Gender Equality Results in ADB Projects*

- changes in gender relations especially in decision making by women (in the project, community, household, other), control over resources related to loan/technical assistance activities, and changes in livelihood due to those activities.
- other unplanned changes for women and men where possible.

Where positive results for women were achieved, the assessment investigated the extent to which they were due to GAPs. If there was no GAP, the assessment investigated the impact of the specific gender provisions included in the loan design. Other factors or conditions that may have had an impact on gender results were also considered including:

- contributions of resident mission gender specialists;
- project resources dedicated to addressing gender issues;
- external social, institutional, and political factors;
- constraints to achieving gender equality results and how they were addressed;
- factors that promoted or reinforced the sustainability of gender equality results;
- the extent to which gender equality results contributed to achieving the overall objectives and results of the loan investment.

### **C. Methodology**

A number of considerations entered into the selection of loan projects for the RGA.

- ⇒ To facilitate synthesis and comparison, three projects in common sectoral areas—agriculture and rural development, human development (either education or health), and governance loans—were assessed.
- ⇒ Loans must have been under implementation for 2 years or more in order for results to be demonstrated.
- ⇒ The sample should include a variety of approaches to addressing gender equality issues in project design and implementation within each country to enable valid lessons to be drawn about positive factors that contribute to quality improvements in loan implementation and the impact of GAPs. Some projects developed GAPs or gender strategies during design; others incorporated GAPs during implementation; and others had some gender provisions. Some had significant involvement from a gender specialist at the resident mission while others had little or no involvement. This criterion was applied to selecting countries as well as to the selection of projects within each country.

In addition to common terms of reference, a common methodological framework was developed for the RGAs with process and outcome indicators. The indicators were modified as needed to respond to differences in types of projects, the degree of integration of gender concerns, and different stages of implementation. Both process and outcome indicators were investigated.

An international gender specialist and ADB's resident mission gender specialist carried out the field assessments (14–15 days in-country). The international specialist provided a fresh,

independent view while ADB's specialist contributed extensive field experience and close association with the project. Project sites were visited and project beneficiaries (women and men), staff, and local stakeholders were interviewed individually and in groups (see Appendix 2) using questions in the methodological framework. Each RGA also reviewed project documents, including RRP, GAPs, back-to-office-reports from review missions, progress reports, ADB case studies, and other relevant documents at the resident missions (see Appendix 4).

The three loan projects included in the Nepal RGA are the following:

- Loan 1461-NEP: Third Livestock Development Project (TLDP), approved September 1996 for \$18.3 million;
- Loan 1861-NEP: Governance Reform Program (GRP), approved November 2001 for \$30 million;
- Loan 1840-NEP: Teacher Education Project (TEP) approved September 2001 for \$25.9 million.

#### **D. Fieldwork for the Nepal Rapid Gender Assessment**

Fieldwork for TLDP included interviews with project team members based in Kathmandu and in Palpa and Rupandehi districts; a meeting with district livestock service office (DLSO) staff from the Ministry of Agriculture and Co-operatives, livestock action team (LAT) members, the women development officer (WDO) and nongovernment organizations (NGOs) involved in social mobilization work in Palpa district; meetings with two women's community-based organizations (CBOs) involved in raising goats in Rupandehi district in the Terai (Devdaha) and Palpa district in the Hills (Lipindevi), and a meeting with a female member of a mixed male/female buffalo group in Palpa.

Fieldwork for GRP included interviews with government stakeholders, staff from the Nepal Administrative Staff College, staff from the Mainstreaming Gender Equity program, and the Civil Society Support Project (CSSP) in addition to a meeting with one citizen monitoring cell in Kavre district set up by CSSP.

Fieldwork for TEP included interviews with staff from the National Centre for Education Development (NCED), one public primary teacher training center (PTTC) in Kavre, and one private PTTC in Kathmandu; meetings with 1 group of in-service teacher trainees (approximately 35 trainees, 50% women) and 1 group of 13 female pre-service trainees who received scholarships from TEP.

Political instability since October 2002 (when the elected government was dismissed by the King) has adversely affected the implementation of all loan projects. There has been very little money available for development due to the priority given to national security in the face of the growing Maoist insurgency in most districts. The implementation of the GRP has been particularly affected.

These constraints have also had an impact on the scope of investigations undertaken during the RGA. Most districts and remote areas are off limits. The Maoists imposed a 3-day all-Nepal transport strike during the second week of the visit. This affected the amount of fieldwork that could be done outside Kathmandu. Meetings in Palpa were also affected by the need to limit time spent with beneficiary groups to avoid alerting local Maoists of the team's presence. Despite these constraints, the RGA included interviews with a range of stakeholders and meetings with stakeholders in three districts (see Appendix 2).

## Chapter 2

# Third Livestock Development Project

### A. Project Description

The overall goal of the project is to reduce poverty in rural areas by improving the nutrition, income, and employment opportunities of farmers and resource-poor rural people, especially women, through increased productivity of the livestock subsector in a manner that is ecologically sustainable and socially equitable.<sup>4</sup> A total of 55,000 farming families was expected to benefit directly from the project at least two thirds of which were below the poverty line. The specific objectives are to:<sup>5</sup>

- (i) improve the productivity of livestock;
- (ii) develop alternative market outlets for livestock products, including milk, meat, eggs, fiber, and live animals;
- (iii) develop the institutional capacity of the Department of Livestock Services (DLS) and related agencies in technical and social spheres;
- (iv) establish livestock farmer groups and develop their capacity to plan, manage, monitor and evaluate their own development and to become self-reliant.

The executing agency is the DLS in the Ministry of Agriculture and Co-operatives (MOAC), and the Nepal Rastra Bank which coordinates the distribution of credit funds to participating financial institutions. The project has three components.<sup>6</sup>

- (i) **Livestock productivity improvement:** Subcomponents include the expansion of forage and feed production on communal and private land; the promotion of pasture seed production; the expansion of private sector veterinary, breeding, and advisory services including the provision of credit; sustaining public sector services by upgrading animal health, livestock extension, and artificial breeding services in district livestock offices; and increased accessibility of livestock credit through a variety of facilities.
- (ii) **Agroprocessing and marketing:** Activities in this component include credit support for civil works, equipment, vehicles, and start-up costs; maintenance and

---

<sup>4</sup> Loan 1461-NEP: Third Livestock Development Project, approved 19 September 1996 for \$18.3 million. Loan became effective: 23 March 1997. The loan is supported by ADB TA 2851-NEP funded by the Australian International Aid Agency (AusAID).

<sup>5</sup> RRP:NEP 25054.

<sup>6</sup> Ibid.

repair of farm-to-market trails; and training and support to farmers and entrepreneurs to become involved in small-scale agroprocessing activities such as livestock slaughter, meat processing and packaging, cheese, yoghurt, ice-cream, and prepackaged pasteurized milk.

- (iii) **Institutional strengthening and organizational development:** This component includes human resource development for DLS; on-site training and exposure visits for farmers; and project management, monitoring, and evaluation. LATs in each district use participatory planning and a systems learning approach to identify “pocket package” programs which are delivered through enterprise-focused farmer groups. The groups consist of around 10 farmers, and 5 farmer groups constitute a CBO with an executive committee consisting of two representatives from each group. After CBOs register as a cooperative, they are seen as primary livestock industry related associations (LIRAs).<sup>7</sup> Following the mid-term review in 2000, this component included a partnership program with 48 local NGOs who is for people contracted to mobilize and strengthen farmer groups in 16 of TLDP’s 19 districts.<sup>8</sup>

## **B. Gender Analysis and Provisions Included in the Loan Design**

There was no GAP included in the loan design; however, some gender analysis and provisions were incorporated in the project design.

- Women are referred to in the project goal and are explicitly identified as beneficiaries,<sup>9</sup> although there are no references to women or gender issues in the project framework.
- There is limited analysis of women’s role in livestock management and care. It is acknowledged that women contribute about 70% of the work in livestock raising and that women make day-to-day decisions on grazing, on collecting fodder and water, and on consumption. There is, however, no mention of how women’s roles vary with different types of livestock, whether they vary for different ethnic or disadvantaged groups, or who controls income from different types of livestock. The need to consider the impact of project activities on women’s workloads, well being, and responsibilities is noted.
- LATs were to hold separate discussions with women and disadvantaged groups to ensure that their views were heard.
- In the RRP, a specific loan assurance was dedicated to “women in development”: “The Government will strongly encourage the participation of women in project implementation. In particular, women will constitute at least 25% of the trainees in

<sup>7</sup> TLDP Back-to-office report 15 January 2004. Eight LIRAs have been formed.

<sup>8</sup> TLDP 2004 Progress Report No. 20: 25; ANZDEC 2004 Technical Assistance Completion Report.

<sup>9</sup> RRP:NEP 25054.

the course for milk quality and hygiene.”<sup>10</sup> This assurance was not, however, included as a major loan covenant.<sup>11</sup>

### C. Development of a Gender Action Plan during Loan Implementation

Social and gender analysis undertaken during the mid-term review in February 2000 showed clearly that women and disadvantaged caste and ethnic groups were far less likely to participate and benefit from TLDP. Of 28 large livestock groups (cattle and buffalo), 61% were exclusively male. An analysis of the breakdown of women’s participation in farmer groups showed that 28% were female, 30% were male, and 42% were mixed. Female participation in mixed groups was low at 15%. Women’s access to credit, training, and extension was significantly lower than men’s, and women’s participation in loan activities was not monitored systematically. Lack of female technical assistants and lack of awareness among male staff on gender-differentiated roles resulted in limited outreach to female farmers.<sup>12</sup>

Following the mid-term review, a GAP was prepared to address these significant gender disparities. The GAP emerged from a 2-day workshop with senior DLS staff, representatives from male and female farmer groups, DLS field staff, district WDOs, and other stakeholders. Two further workshops were also held for training and planning to ensure that the GAP was developed and modified in a participatory manner by stakeholders responsible for implementing and monitoring the project.<sup>13</sup> The GAP focused primarily on increasing women’s participation in livestock enterprise groups. Table 1 details gender strategies and provisions included. Key elements are:<sup>14</sup>

- discontinuation of all-male groups, a revised target of 35% female participation in livestock groups, and an increased focus on mixed male-female and all-female groups, including those formed by district WDOs and partner NGOs;
- partnerships with NGOs and other financial institutions to allow women to access credit up to NRs 30,000 using group guarantees as collateral;
- increased efforts to involve women in all forms of project training;
- training for project staff and LATs to increase awareness of gender disparities in access to benefits through seminars, management meetings and other forums and to increase awareness of women’s central contributions to the livestock sector and the links between addressing gender issues and achieving the project’s overall development objectives;
- hiring two development facilitators (one female and one male) to provide training and support to project staff and LATs on gender sensitization and social

---

<sup>10</sup> Ibid.

<sup>11</sup> ANZDEC 2004 Op. cit; TLDP 15 January 2004: Op. cit. Appendix 2.

<sup>12</sup> “Nepal Third Livestock Project: Midcourse Corrections to Safeguard Women as Project Beneficiaries”; and “Loan 1461-NEP: Third Livestock Development Project”.

<sup>13</sup> Karki Rukmini, 2000, 2001, 2002.

<sup>14</sup> References for the elements of the GAP are detailed in Table 1 of Appendix 1 and include Rukmini Karki 2000, 2001, 2002 and various case studies which document the GAP (see Appendix 4).

mobilization (a budget was allocated for each district for this training and for leadership training for women);

- including WDOs, female farmers, and NGO representatives in district LATs;
- selecting NGO partners with female members on the executive committee and with experience in community mobilization and gender sensitization.

#### **D. Discussion of Achievements and Results**

By focusing on women and the small ruminants for which they are responsible, the GAP has improved targeting of the poorest households. TLDP has combined quality technical assistance with sound social mobilization supported by links to other local development organizations. This approach promotes ownership by the community and sustainability of benefits. TLDP's GAP is fully owned by DLS. The success of GAP strategies has had a broader institutional impact on DLS which applies lessons learned to other areas of work across the sector. Sustainability is also enhanced by the fact that successful gender strategies have been replicated in the ADB-financed Community Livestock Development Project (CLDP).

The share of project benefits enjoyed by women and the poor has increased markedly with the GAP. TLDP has decreased women's workloads for collecting fodder and has improved their livestock management skills; has increased women's access to income (which reduces their vulnerability to poverty); and has supported progress towards changes in gender relations by supporting women's involvement in decision making in the household and community organizations and by expanding women's social and economic networks. However, there are a number of areas where women's access to and utilization of project resources need to be strengthened. Results related to gender equality that were achieved since the GAP was prepared are summarized in Box 1 and discussed below with more details provided in Table 1 of Appendix 1.

##### **1. Individual and Household Benefits**

Since the preparation of the GAP, there has been a significant increase in women's membership in farmer groups from 26% to 44% in 2003 and to 51% in 2004 due to a poverty alleviation program targeted at disadvantaged and ex-bonded women. Goat and poultry groups have the highest participation of women at 77% and 66% respectively. In March 2004, 16% of TLDP's farmer groups were male only (compared with 30% before the GAP), 44% were female only and 41% were mixed.<sup>15</sup>

Increasing women's membership in farmer groups was a key GAP strategy. With group membership, women gain access to project resources and benefits such as training in livestock management provided on site and to a lesser extent to training provided outside the village. Project staff and LAT members consistently report that women who participate in farmer groups have more confidence, more ability to discuss issues and speak out about their concerns or request training, an ability to plan ahead, increased mobility, and more awareness of other government services they can access. Some of these benefits were confirmed by women's groups who

---

<sup>15</sup> ANZDEC. 2004. *Technical Assistance Completion Report and TLDP 2004 Progress Report*. Op cit.

highlighted the support they got from the group and their ability to speak up and ask questions even in the presence of men.

**Box 1: Third Livestock Development Project: Summary of Gender Equality Results**

Project Component	Gender Equality Results
Project goal: poverty reduction	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>⇒ TLDP is successfully reducing poverty by targeting women for small livestock activities.</li> <li>⇒ Women have increased control over income and spend their earnings on food, education, and health care.</li> </ul>
Livestock production: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Fodder</li> <li>■ Training in animal health</li> <li>■ Credit</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>⇒ Women’s workloads have decreased due to TLDP fodder production.</li> <li>⇒ No disaggregated data are available on the total number of women and men trained and active as village animal health workers.</li> <li>⇒ No women have been trained as para-vets.</li> <li>⇒ Women can access loans from their own group savings funds, and some NGOs are facilitating access to credit from nonproject sources using group collateral. (Data on women’s access to project credit are not available.)</li> </ul>
Agroprocessing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>⇒ Women are now more likely to be consulted in decision making about agroprocessing and the use of credit.</li> <li>⇒ Women’s participation in training for meat production, butchery, milk processing, and marketing is low (8–14% of trainees). Few women utilize their training.</li> <li>⇒ Women’s overall share in agroprocessing is low but varies from district to district.</li> </ul>
Institutional strengthening <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Livestock action teams</li> <li>■ Farmer groups and community-based organizations (CBOs)</li> <li>■ Gender training</li> <li>■ Monitoring and Sustainability</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>⇒ There is increased participation of women in livestock planning and management in district livestock action teams.</li> <li>⇒ Female participation in farmer groups increased from 26% in 1999 to 51% in 2004.</li> <li>⇒ Women make up 44% of participants in on-site training, and 35% of participants in training outside the village.</li> <li>⇒ 44% of representatives in executive committees of CBOs are women.</li> <li>⇒ TLDP staff have greater recognition of female farmers and their roles in livestock production.</li> <li>⇒ TLDP gender strategies have been applied to other areas of work done by the Department of Livestock Services.</li> <li>⇒ TLDP learning has been applied to the design of the new Community Livestock Development Project.</li> </ul>

Women reported that they controlled the income earned by selling goats either solely or jointly with their husbands. Some women from the Devdaha women's goat group reported that they contributed part of their earnings to the family budget and kept only a small amount (NRs 300–400) for themselves. Women's earnings are spent on essentials such as vegetables, oil, personal items, children's educational needs, and family health care.

It was not possible to directly explore the benefits gained from women's membership in mixed large livestock groups (cattle and buffalo). Men mainly control income from large livestock, although there are exceptions. Project staff and LAT members report that where there is a critical mass of women in the group, women benefit by being involved in decision making about livestock management, by their access to training opportunities, and by the fact that both men and women are exposed to gender awareness training on women's workloads. Further investigation is needed on women's control and use of income earned in large livestock groups.

Project staff indicated that school attendance had increased as a result of the earnings and time saving due to project activities, but this could not be verified by fieldwork.<sup>16</sup> In Devdaha, both boys and girls were attending school before TLDP, and the women said that they would keep girls in school even if their workloads increased. However, in Devdaha, boys were sent to better (private) schools than girls before TLDP. When asked if they intended to send girls to private schools, women said that they would not even if more money were available in the future. This response suggests that more discussions on girls' and women's rights are needed in farmer groups to reinforce changes in gender relations.

Project staff and LAT members believe that overall, women's workloads have decreased due to the proximity of fodder and to the increasing likelihood that men will assist with fodder collection and childcare while women attend group meetings. For example, 53% of beneficiaries of fodder production activities in Palpa district were women.<sup>17</sup> However, the Devdaha women's goat raising CBO reported that while their workloads had increased, they had commensurate benefits in terms of increased income from the sale of goats. It is likely that changes in workloads will vary depending on the type of livestock enterprise undertaken by the group with a higher likelihood of women continuing to contribute unpaid labor in large livestock groups. It would be useful to further explore differences in benefits from women's membership in different types of livestock groups so that lessons can be applied to new projects such as CLDP.

The majority of benefits from agroprocessing have gone to men despite efforts to involve women. Women's participation in training for meat production, butchery, milk processing and marketing is low ranging from between 8–14%<sup>18</sup> which is below the 25% target mentioned in the RRP. Women's share in agroprocessing could not be verified in the field but appears to be relatively minor overall compared with men's, although it was reported to vary from one district to

---

<sup>16</sup> An NGO study of 50 households in Bhuwanpokhari in Palpa district found that there was an 80% increase in female children in school. Sherchand, Laxman and Ava Shrestha 2004 "Third Livestock Development Project Gender Mainstreaming Experiences, Nepal" PowerPoint presentation.

<sup>17</sup> Bhandari, Tulsi Ram. 2003.

<sup>18</sup> *TLDP 2004 Progress Report*. Op. cit.

another. This was not highlighted in GAP workshops. Further efforts to support women in productive agroprocessing activities are needed in future.

One strategy noted in the GAP was the use of partnerships with NGOs and other financial institutions to allow women to access credit of up to NRs 30,000 using group guarantees as collateral. In both groups interviewed for the RGA, women had not accessed any credit from TLDP sources. However, savings funds collected by the groups (NRs 50 per member monthly) were loaned to women for essentials, including health care and for a few small retail shops in Devdaha.<sup>19</sup> Data disaggregated by sex, caste, or ethnic group on access to project credit and repayment are not available. NRs 211 million had been distributed to 7,088 farmers by March 2004. Given the rules of the participating bank regarding the need for land as collateral for loans over NRs 30,000, it is likely that the majority of credit has been accessed by males and beneficiaries involved in cattle and buffalo enterprises and agroprocessing. Equal access to credit is an issue that may be linked to women's inability to utilize agroprocessing training and requires further attention in future.

A strategic gain for women from GAP implementation is that the project now requires permission from both the husband and wife before a loan is granted to the family. This may provide more security for women regarding the use of loans for project purposes as long as they play a decision-making role. Project staff are aware of potential risks to women when large loans are taken by husbands without their wives' consent. Many stakeholders report that the benefits from credit are enjoyed by the family as a whole, even though the credit may be formally accessed by men. Further investigation is needed in this area.

Another important and strategic change in gender relations is men's increasing acceptance of new roles for women. Project staff, LAT members, and women's groups were consistent in their responses about men's attitudes to women's involvement in TLDP livestock groups. While there has been some initial male resistance to women's involvement in livestock enterprise groups and interaction with outsiders (women's groups reported that initially some husbands reprimanded their wives), men are slowly coming to accept these new roles for women. A number of factors have contributed to this. In any one village, there may be 50 households involved in each CBO across a number of different wards. This tends to normalize women's involvement. In addition to gender awareness training which takes place as part of NGO social mobilization activities (for example the 24-hour day exercise which focuses on male and female workloads), there is discussion if any problems arise and decisions are recorded. Negotiation and, if necessary, pressure from the group supports women's involvement. A number of GAP strategies may have contributed to this success, including selecting gender-sensitive NGOs for community mobilization activities; gender sensitization training provided to DLS staff, farmer groups, and other stakeholders; and the inclusion of WDOs and female farmer representatives in district LATs. The fact that women earn money from their livestock activities has also been a factor in increasing male acceptance.

---

<sup>19</sup> Some women in both groups have access to micro-credit through their association with other development organizations. This was facilitated by TLDP's NGO partner in Lipindevi.

## **2. Community Benefits**

Strategic changes in gender relations may be occurring with women's increased involvement in formal decision making. At the district level, women are now members of LATs that undertake planning and monitoring of DLS activities across the district. Seventy-four percent of LATs include one woman (the WDO) and the remainder include two or three women (usually the WDO and a female farmer). Most LATs have eight or nine members.<sup>20</sup> Project staff reported that women are actively involved in decision making through their membership in female-only and mixed CBOs.

Women's membership in groups has increased community solidarity and collective action to solve problems and has expanded women's social and economic networks leading to better access to information and services. This is partly due to the project's flexible use of partnerships with other development organizations involved in social mobilization and the establishment and nurturing of farmer groups such as WDOs, local and international NGOs, and village and district development committees that have direct links to other government line agencies. In some cases, TLDP technical inputs have been provided to groups already established for some years by NGOs or WDOs. This is a very efficient utilization of resources that enhances gender equality outcomes and also contributes to the sustainability of benefits.

## **3. Sustainability**

The sustainability of benefits will be enhanced by the sustainability of the groups themselves and by the graduation of CBOs to cooperatives and district livestock associations that will manage tasks such as fodder and forage production in future. TLDP's plan is to provide groups with a full package of support (including training, forage and fodder development, and livestock insurance) for 5 years then hand them over to cooperatives. Using existing social networks and support systems and working as partners with development organizations will undoubtedly increase the likelihood of sustaining TLDP benefits.

Women were clear that their groups/CBOs would continue into the future because of the benefits of their savings and loan activities and their support and potential for collective action. Most project stakeholders believe that mixed groups will be more sustainable than female-only groups, particularly where women are illiterate, as long as men are supportive. One positive example noted by a staff member is of a pig-raising group of illiterate women. It was agreed that men would help the women with accounts and record keeping, and would withdraw when women were able to take on these roles themselves.

Due to government spending on security that has reduced the development budget, some women's goat-raising groups have not received a full package of support. For example, in Lipindevi the partner NGO refused its contract payment from TLDP to ensure that some goats could be purchased and distributed. In some cases (e.g. Devdaha CBO), women have had to wait up to 5 years to receive their goats (whose kids are passed on as a revolving loan from one group to

---

<sup>20</sup> *TLDP 2004 Progress Report. Op. cit.*

another). While stakeholders indicated that this is an exceptional case, these practices are a risk to sustainability, and TLDP staff have learned from these experiences. In TLDP's poverty alleviation program, all women's groups will receive goats in their first year with the program in addition to a full package of technical support. As long as adequate fodder (so livestock can be stall-fed and girls won't have to leave school to collect fodder) and adequate animal health services are available, it seems likely that the goat program will deliver sustainable benefits to the poorest women and their families.

#### **4. Contribution of Gender Provisions and Results to Poverty Reduction**

There is no doubt that the GAP strategies and the involvement of the Nepal resident mission (NRM) gender specialist have significantly helped to achieve TLDP's goal of reducing poverty. Large livestock groups are dominated by males and people of Brahman and Chhetri castes.<sup>21</sup> The majority of the poor are unable to invest in and care for large livestock and are unable to access credit. By targeting women, TLDP has increased its focus on the small ruminants they care for and has thus increasingly and more effectively targeted the poor.

In March 2004, 60% of TLDP's 17,522 participating farmers were in small livestock groups, and 71% of these group members were women.<sup>22</sup> Women who previously earned little or nothing were earning up to NRs 4,000 per year (compared with a poverty line of NRs 4,404 per person per year<sup>23</sup>) and had access to microcredit (from group savings funds) to provide for health emergencies, school fees, and in some cases, small enterprise development. However, as noted by project staff, poverty reduction is limited to those households in farmer groups participating in the pocket package program.<sup>24</sup> The expansion of the goat program to a further 2,200 women/households in the final year of the project is a positive initiative that will further reduce poverty.

#### **5. Institutional Impacts**

TLDP's GAP has had broader institutional and policy impacts. GAP strategies have brought about demonstrable results for women and have clearly increased DLS's effectiveness at reducing poverty. This has reinforced a willingness to institutionalize gender mainstreaming and has consolidated DLS's ownership of the GAP.

TLDP strategies for mobilizing community ownership and for targeting women have been shared with DLS, and there has been some replication of women's goat-raising groups in non-TLDP areas. Lessons and successful strategies from TLDP have also been incorporated into the design of CLDP, the fourth ADB-financed livestock project.

---

<sup>21</sup> Bhandari, Tulsī Ram. Op. cit. In Palpa district, Brahmin and Chhetri castes make up more than 83–99% of cattle and buffalo group membership, 69% of whom are male.

<sup>22</sup> *TLDP 2004 Progress Report*. Op. cit.

<sup>23</sup> RRP:NEP 32238 (from 1996 Nepal Living Standards Survey).

<sup>24</sup> For example in Palpa, less than 7% of households in the district are covered through farmer group membership (Bhandari, Tulsī Ram Op. cit.).

**E. Challenges**

Important challenges for the future are the need to increase the productivity of poor women's labor by increasing their access to agroprocessing training, by further improving their small livestock management skills, by focusing on adding value through agroprocessing activities, and by increasing women's access to credit. CLDP has a target of 35–50% women's participation in all technology training,<sup>25</sup> but the more significant challenge is how to improve the utilization of agroprocessing training by both women and men. Often, it is important to have a critical mass of women involved in training in addition to mentoring and supporting their efforts in small enterprise development through groups and CBOs in order to establish new roles. CBOs could assess the most economically and socially viable agroprocessing strategies for poor households.

Employing women as junior technical assistants (JTAs) and junior technicians (JTs) in DLS is a major challenge, along with training and supporting village women to work as para-vets and as village agricultural health workers (VAHWs). No women were trained as para-vets during the project though 30 men were. Currently there are 439 VAHWs registered with TLDP, but no sex-disaggregated data are available for the number trained, registered, or actually working as VAHWs. In Palpa district, 14% of the 252 beneficiaries trained as VAHWs are women, but only 19 men and 9 women (32%) are active.<sup>26</sup> Similarly, only 4% of JTAs and JTs in MOAC are women.<sup>27</sup> Women are recognized as knowledgeable in the treatment of sick animals,<sup>28</sup> and women are increasingly graduating from technical schools.<sup>29</sup> It is important for an innovative government agency such as DLS to make the most of such opportunities by increasing the proportion of females employed as JTAs and JTs and by training and mentoring women to work as VAHWs, para-vets and livestock development assistants in CLDP.<sup>30</sup>

Employing women as technical staff was noted by some project staff as particularly important for initiating contact with female beneficiaries. It is possible that female staff (including those in partner organizations) may support women's efforts to reflect and take action on other areas of gender inequality facing women and girls which may help to advance or reinforce changes in gender relations (such as equal educational opportunities for girls). Once women gain confidence and develop capacity, liaising with men can support positive changes in gender relations. For example, women in the Devdaha group said that if they had shied away from talking with a male JTA, they never would have got used to approaching one for technical guidance. The women said that although they were uncomfortable initially, they got over it and are now happy

---

<sup>25</sup> This is a reasonable target when one considers that women are responsible for 35% of milking and milk disposal tasks (ADB. 1999. *Country Briefing Paper: Women in Nepal 119*) and the need for a critical mass of women to be involved to have any significant impact.

<sup>26</sup> Bhandari, Tulsi Ram. Op. cit.

<sup>27</sup> See discussion in footnote 44.

<sup>28</sup> ADB. 1999. Op. cit.

<sup>29</sup> During an interview with TLDP staff on 6/6/2004, it was noted that there are now "high" numbers of females graduating from technical schools who would be eligible for appointment as JTs and JTAs. Actual numbers of female graduates were not obtained during the RGA.

<sup>30</sup> Sherchand, Laxman and Ava Shrestha 2004.

that they can talk freely with male DLS officers. (DLS staff including JTAs received gender training from TLDP.)

The appointment of female staff to DLS is an equity issue in its own right apart from the incentive of improving project effectiveness. Mentoring existing female staff and ensuring that they have equal access to fieldwork and training opportunities are also important. Mobility constraints on female para-vets also need to be addressed.

There are a number of constraints on both women and men in utilizing their training as VAHWs. VAHW services are provided free of charge, and farmers often lack confidence in their expertise. It may be more effective to train women and men from their own groups and CBOs or to target younger literate women from farming households. These approaches have already been initiated by the project; it would be useful to monitor and analyze their comparative success in TLDP and CLDP.

## **F. Factors Influencing the Achievement of Gender Equality Results**

### **1. Effectiveness of the GAP**

TLDP is a good example of effective strategies for addressing poverty and social and gender equality issues. The preparation and implementation of a GAP with specific activities and targets for improving women's participation and benefits had a significant positive impact on improving the overall implementation and results for women.

- ⇒ **Linking the GAP to the project goal:** Explicit reference to women and poverty reduction in the project goal provided an important incentive for TLDP staff to develop and implement effective strategies for targeting poor households by focusing on women using gender-sensitive community mobilization strategies. This is a powerful rationale because the poor, ultra-poor, and disadvantaged groups are more likely to raise small livestock, usually a responsibility of women that is under their control. The ability to demonstrate that working with women meets poverty reduction and social equity objectives is one factor in DLS's success in applying gender and community mobilization strategies in non-TLDP areas.
- ⇒ **Sound gender analysis and involvement of NRM gender specialist:** The mid-term review provided an opportunity for the NRM gender specialist to work closely with TLDP staff to do a gender analysis, demonstrate gender disparities, and develop workable strategies for implementation.
- ⇒ **Ownership of the GAP:** Ownership of gender strategies by TLDP and a participatory and flexible approach to the GAP were important factors. It was developed and modified in a series of three workshops with project staff, WDOs, other stakeholders from local development organizations, and female farmers. These workshops ensured that key stakeholders understood women's roles in livestock development and the rationale behind gender strategies.

- ⇒ **Adequate GAD skills and resources:** The appointment of two community development facilitators for TLDP, one of whom was a local gender specialist, provided critical resources for implementing the GAP.
- ⇒ **Gender awareness and ongoing capacity development using routine management forums and special gender training:** Routine monthly DLSO staff meetings were used as a forum for problem solving on social mobilization and gender issues by the TLDP gender specialist. Gender training was provided to staff, and quarterly LAT planning meetings provided an ongoing opportunity to discuss gender issues. The involvement of district WDOs as important stakeholders was a key strategy. The GAP included training and communication strategies targeted at different levels: farmer groups, LAT members, project staff in DLSO, and DLS/TLDP staff at headquarters.
- ⇒ **Gender sensitive NGO selection criteria:** The use of NGOs with demonstrated experience in community mobilization and gender sensitization was another important factor. It is reasonable to conclude that this contributed to progress toward strategic changes in gender relations.
- ⇒ **Realistic targets and monitoring:** Explicit government norms and targets for the participation of women are essential as is the use of sex-disaggregated data for monitoring progress towards targets. Progress towards equal access to project resources and benefits is slower where targets have not been set and where sex-disaggregated data have not been routinely collected and reported. Ongoing involvement of the NRM gender specialist and monitoring of project implementation generally by NRM staff played a positive role.

## 2. Institutional Factors

**Leadership and good management practices:** DLS has been described as a pioneering, open, and responsive department. It has demonstrated capacity to learn from experience by adapting strategies to improve effectiveness and benefits. Teamwork approach and good communication patterns have been positive factors along with committed, stable leadership for TLDP. This approach encourages all staff to reflect on the strengths and shortcomings of community mobilization and GAP strategies and adaptations to improve outcomes. In short, good project management is critical for developing appropriate strategies for addressing social and gender inequalities.

### G. Recommendations

(i) TLDP and the upcoming CLDP should routinely disaggregate data by sex for all project activities in project reports in addition to membership in farmer groups. This data should be regularly monitored by the ADB gender specialist and other ADB staff. This is a basic requirement for monitoring whether women have equal access to project resources and benefits and for reviewing and refining gender strategies. Consideration should also be given to disaggregating data by ethnicity and caste to assist with monitoring poverty reduction. Sex-disaggregated data should be used to monitor the following:

- all staff and farmer training on-site, regionally, and overseas and all technology training;
- the utilization of training provided to farmers (for example, for agroprocessing, for the local provision of animal health services, the proportion of women working as livestock development assistants, and strategies for increasing the numbers of females providing animal health services);
- membership in mixed CBOs, LIRAs, and farmer coordination committees including membership in the executive committees of these organizations;
- funds held by different types of farmer groups (male, female, and mixed);
- access to and repayment of project credit.

**Box 2. Third Livestock Development Project: Recommendations**

- All data should be sex-disaggregated.
- Women’s access to credit should be carefully monitored and assessed.
- Impact studies should assess changes in women’s (i) workloads, (ii) benefits from joining different types of livestock groups, (iii) control over credit, (iv) participation and decision making in community-based organizations, and (v) the factors that lead to strategic changes in gender relations.
- The Department of Livestock Services and the Ministry of Agriculture and Co-operatives should set a target for hiring more women junior technical assistants and junior technicians.

(ii) Women’s access to credit in the upcoming CLDP should be closely monitored by DLS and ADB staff to assess the effectiveness of different lending modalities and investment models in targeting women. Increasing women’s access to credit is an important equality issue that is critical for improving the productivity of their labor. Further investigation is needed regarding the success of the TLDP GAP strategy in partnering with NGOs to facilitate women’s access to small loans using group guarantees as collateral. CLDP should set a realistic target for women’s access to credit similar to that proposed for other project resources (35–50%).

(iii) Future impact studies of TLDP should explore the following areas so that findings can be applied to the implementation of CLDP GAP strategies.

- Measure changes in workloads for women involved in different types of livestock enterprise groups (female-only and mixed groups for large and small livestock) including changes in the productivity of women’s labor and increases or decreases in unpaid labor.
- Compare the benefits women gain from joining mixed large livestock groups where they are less likely to control income with benefits for women in small livestock groups where they are more likely to control income. It may also be useful to explore any differences in expenditure of income, and to compare changes in gender relations such as changes in decision making in households and communities. (Given a choice, what type of groups would women choose to join? What types of agroprocessing do they think has most potential for success?)

- Compare male and female access to and use of project credit including women's decision making regarding the use of credit, control of credit, and the use of the income gained from credit.
- Assess the long-term sustainability of farmer CBOs and cooperatives and the factors that reinforce and support women's participation and decision making in CBOs, particularly mixed CBOs.
- Identify factors that promote and sustain positive changes in gender relations such as those related to decision making (in households and communities) and to equal access by boys and girls to quality schooling. For example, it may be useful to assess differences in outcomes if male or female staff liaise with and support women's groups and if different types of NGOs are involved in social mobilization and ongoing support.

(iv) DLS and MOAC should take steps to increase the proportion of women working in the department. An appropriate target should be set for the proportion of women working as JTAs and JTs on CLDP.

## Chapter 3

# Governance Reform Program

### A. Project Description

The overall goal of GRP<sup>31</sup> is to establish a civil service that is more results and people oriented and gender responsive and that will contribute to higher economic growth and poverty reduction. The executing agency for the loan is the Ministry of General Administration (MOGA) in cooperation with four other ministries (finance, agriculture, education, and health) that are implementing selected program components. The agreement provides for three payments. A policy matrix summarizes payment conditions and milestones including policy measures and implementation arrangements that must be fulfilled for release of the second and third disbursements (tranches). The project has five components.

- (i) **Develop an internal capacity to lead reforms:** The aim is to improve leadership, management, and support for the reform effort through a cabinet subcommittee (Administrative Reforms Coordination and Monitoring Committee); and through special change units within each key ministry that will coordinate and direct the reforms. The Governance and Reform Coordination Unit in MOGA (GRCU) will work with civil society organizations for public dissemination, feedback, and independent monitoring of the reform program.
- (ii) **Improve the efficiency of the civil service:** The aim is to save money by “rightsizing” the government and to improve personnel management to enhance performance and improve outcomes of core civil service functions. Activities include developing and implementing a voluntary early retirement scheme, preparing policy papers and plans for each ministry on rightsizing, and computerizing personnel records of civil servants and teachers with links to approved posts and to the payroll system.
- (iii) **Improve governance and reduce corruption in government:** The aim is to strengthen the legal framework for combating corruption, to enforce its implementation, and to ensure the involvement of civil society in the government’s anticorruption efforts.

---

<sup>31</sup> Loan 1861-NEP: Governance Reform Program, approved 27 November 2001 for \$30 million. The loan is supported by ADB Technical Assistance 3622-NEP (completed in December 2002); by 2 technical assistance packages cofinanced by the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation; and a package from Department for International Development of the United Kingdom focusing on gender mainstreaming still to be finalised at the time of the RGA.

- (iv) **Enhance competence and motivation of civil servants:** This will be accomplished by adopting modern human resource management principles and increasing pay levels. Outputs include amendments to the civil service act to strengthen personnel assessments; merit-based recruitment, promotion, and grievance procedures; and revisions to the curriculum for civil servants.
- (v) **Establish processes for improving performance in key ministries:** The aim is to deliver better services to citizens by reinforcing a new public management culture and new work processes. Each of the four ministries will develop plans for using performance incentive funds. New service standards will be established.

#### **B. Gender Provisions Included in the Loan Design<sup>32</sup>**

While no GAP was developed, a number of gender provisions were included in the loan design and the Ministry of Women, Children and Social Welfare (MOWCSW) was included as a key stakeholder. Gender provisions included in the program loan are listed by component in Table 2 of Appendix 1 and include the following.

- The goal of the loan refers to the need for the civil service to be gender responsive.
- Gender focal points are to be established in each ministry. MOGA and Ministry of Finance (MOF) gender focal points are a condition for the release of tranche two, and gender focal points in the Ministry of Education and Sports (MOES), the Ministry of Health (MOH) and MOAC are a condition for the release of tranche three.
- Annual plans on governance reforms in each of the five ministries are to be gender sensitive. Annual reports on progress in governance reforms are to include information on women.
- Rightsizing policies and plans for MOF, MOAC, MOES and MOH are expected to narrow the gap between male and female civil servants.
- Teacher recruitment and remuneration policies are to be gender sensitive.
- An affirmative action policy and program to increase the representation of women in the civil service, including in senior positions, is included as a condition for the release of tranche two.<sup>33</sup>
- MOGA and MOWSCW are to introduce appropriate nonmonetary benefits and procedures to increase the representation of women in the civil service and to address other gender issues. This is a condition for the release of tranche two.
- Coaching classes are to be provided for women to prepare them for the civil service entry examinations for gazetted officers.
- MOGA is to review annual progress on increased representation of women in the civil service.
- MOGA is to issue a directive to line ministries to include women in civil service staff development training.

---

<sup>32</sup> RRP: NEP 32238 and Shrestha, *Ava Case Studies: Nepal*.

<sup>33</sup> RRP: NEP 32238.

- MOGA and the Nepal Administrative Staff College (NASC) are to revise the curricula and duration of formal training courses to include gender issues.
- MOGA will establish a gender sensitive, merit-based approach to recruitment and promotion and will prepare new gender sensitive procedures for handling grievances.

One assurance included in the project document is that, "...the Government will take all appropriate and necessary measures to mainstream gender and increase the percentage of women civil servants."<sup>34</sup> In addition, the project framework includes some gender-sensitive indicators and two significant gender risks: resistance in the bureaucracy to advancing affirmative action policies and that gender is not seen as a central issue in the governance reform agenda.<sup>35</sup>

### C. Discussion of Achievements and Progress

In late 2003, the government endorsed a road map for implementing the reform program that set targets and actions and included all major loan conditions for the release of tranche two, including those relating to gender equality. However, the 2004 loan review mission concluded that the momentum for reform that prevailed in 2002 during implementation of technical assistance project 3622 had not been sustained. While many of the thematic proposals and recommendations prepared by the consultants for that project were discussed at the ministerial level, "...very little progress has been achieved in terms of internalizing these recommendations and their implementation."<sup>36</sup> This applies to the implementation of gender provisions as well. Other reports had similar conclusions.<sup>37</sup> Tranche two was due to be disbursed by July 2003 but was still outstanding in June 2004 when the RGA was done. Lack of progress on an affirmative action policy and program to increase the representation of women in the civil service was one condition that had not been met.

A number of reasons have been suggested for this lack of progress including political instability and the Maoist insurgency. Changes in leadership in the civil service and the lack of incentives to translate policy commitments into action were other factors.<sup>38</sup>

Since the RGA was done, the cabinet has approved a reservation policy for women and disadvantaged groups in the civil service and government-funded institutions for 5 years. This includes the reservation of one high-level post (Joint Secretary or Under Secretary) in all ministries.<sup>39</sup> This is a significant achievement and demonstrates the positive effects of gender

---

<sup>34</sup> Ibid.

<sup>35</sup> Ibid.

<sup>36</sup> ADB. 2004. Loan 1861: Governance Reform Program – Aide-Memoire of Loan Review Mission, 23 December – 8 January 2004. Technical assistance project 3622 focused on institutional support for the GRP.

<sup>37</sup> ADB. 2003. *Institutional Support for Governance Reform: ISCR Final Report*. CCSP. 2004. *Progress Monitoring of the Governance Reform Program of HMG/N*.

<sup>38</sup> Ibid.

<sup>39</sup> *The Kathmandu Post*, 24 September 2004.

equality conditions in a program/policy loan. Gender equality has been squarely placed on the governance and public sector reform agenda.

The government's road map for reform retains most of the gender sensitive language and policy commitments included in the gender provisions of the project design. The road map is a positive statement of intention that is an achievement in and of itself, and some gender provisions have been implemented (see Box 3). However, while the environment for increasing women's representation in the civil service is improving, consensus on actions needed to promote greater gender equality is lacking. The slow pace of implementation indicates a lack of clear commitment and ownership of gender provisions. Systematic follow-up is needed to ensure that gender provisions are actually implemented. Progress towards gender equality results is summarized in Box 3 and discussed below with more details provided in Table 2 of Appendix 1.

### **1. Loan Conditions Leverage High-Level Support for Gender Equality**

Gender and social equality are now firmly on the governance reform agenda and are a subject of legitimate debate which they were not 2 years ago when the loan was initiated. Approval by the cabinet of a reservation policy for women in the civil service is a major achievement. This is partly due to a condition for the release of tranche two funds. It also responds to calls for equity in the civil service from civil society groups over a number of years. While further work is needed to achieve consensus on feasible gender mainstreaming initiatives, some stakeholders identify the discussion over the last 2 years as an important achievement in itself.

Using gender equality provisions as conditions for disbursements in public sector reform loans is an example of good practice in governance initiatives. It is a positive outcome of policy dialogue between ADB and the Government of Nepal. It leveraged high-level support for addressing gender gaps, it supports the efforts of local civil society organizations, and it could have positive implications for future governance policy loans. It widens the governance and public sector reform agenda and creates further opportunities for civil society to work toward gender equality.

### **2. Community Benefits**

It is difficult to assess other community benefits at this early stage of implementation. So far, most efforts have focused on increasing the number of women in the civil service. Many steps are required to achieve this including getting women to apply for the civil service exam, pass it, and be appointed; family-friendly work practices for women and men; and mentoring and promoting women in the civil service.

**Box 3: Governance Reform Program: Summary of Gender Equality Results**

Project Component	Progress on Gender Equality Results
Project goal: a more gender responsive civil service	⇒ Efforts have focused on increasing the representation of women in the civil service. Progress in some areas is satisfactory but is very slow in others.
Internal capacity: ■ Gender focal points in five ministries	⇒ Gender focal points have been identified in all five ministries including a gender unit in MOGA. ⇒ The focal points lack resources, guidelines, capacity, and the seniority to mainstream gender equality.
Civil Society Support Project – no gender provision	⇒ Citizen monitoring cells are 16% women. ⇒ Two posters show both women and men in positive, active decision-making roles.
Improve efficiency in the civil service ■ Rightsizing plans to narrow the gender gap	⇒ There has been a marginal increase (less than 1%) in the number of women in the civil service, but the percentage of women at senior decision-making levels has decreased. ⇒ The road map does not mention narrowing the gender gap in relation to rightsizing plans.
Competence and motivation of civil servants ■ Affirmative action policy and program  ■ Nonmonetary benefits ■ Coaching classes for women ■ Merit-based recruitment and promotion ■ Training curricula  ■ Gender-sensitive grievance procedures	⇒ The road map proposes reservation of 20% of vacant new-entry posts for women for five years and the appointment of one woman in each ministry to class I or II posts. The cabinet has recently approved a policy that reserves places for women and disadvantaged groups although there is significant disagreement among stakeholders about the merits of reservation (as opposed to targets) and on how to implement the policy. The percentage of civil service posts to be reserved was not mentioned in the cabinet decision. ⇒ Some nonmonetary benefits were introduced in 1998, and the road map proposes additional benefits. No results have been demonstrated yet. ⇒ Coaching classes have taken place, but there has been little impact on female entries into the civil service to date. ⇒ The cabinet has “regularized” the positions of district woman development officers, but no decision has been made regarding how to do this. ⇒ Gender issues are now addressed in Nepal Administrative Staff College curricula. ⇒ There is disagreement among stakeholders regarding whether recruitment, promotion, personnel assessment, and grievance procedures need to change.
Improving performance in key ministries	⇒ There were no gender provisions for this component mentioned in the RRP or road map although the technical assistance report recommended gender mainstreaming in this area. This is critical for ensuring equal access to resources and benefits at the district level for women.

Between 1995/1996 and 1999/2000, only 4% of applicants for the civil service exam for the class III gazetted level were women. By 2001/2002, 12% of all applicants were women.<sup>40</sup> This demonstrates the success of joint awareness-raising initiatives by MOGA and MOWCSW to promote the civil service as a career option for Nepal's female university graduates (18% of the total). The success rate in the civil service exam for female applicants also rose from less than 1% to 7% over the same period compared with a success rate of 18% for male applicants in 2001/2002.<sup>41</sup> While there is still great room for improvement, these increases may be due to coaching programs that assist women to prepare for the exams.<sup>42</sup>

Not all successful exam candidates are appointed to the civil service. The table below shows a marginal increase for women between 2001 and 2004: female representation increased by less than 1% overall and by less than 0.1% for gazetted officers who took the exam. There was also a marked drop in the number of women at decision-making levels (special and class I) from 4% to 2% as predicted in the RRP due to retirement of senior female civil servants.<sup>43</sup> Moreover, these figures give an inflated picture of the extent of female employment in the civil service since 59% of all female civil servants are employed by the MOH. For example, only 5% of the staff of the MOAC was female and only 4% of JT and JTAs were women.<sup>44</sup>

Even with a reservation policy, it will take many years to achieve a reasonable level of female employment in the civil service. Assuming there is a 5% vacancy rate annually, the government's proposed reservation policy of 20% of vacant new-entry posts would yield a 1% annual increase in the overall percentage of women in the civil service.<sup>45</sup> Regularizing the positions of WDOs will add about 1% to the overall proportion of women in the civil service in one stroke

---

<sup>40</sup> RRP: NEP 32238. Mainali (no date) and the Public Service Commission's (PSC) Annual Report 2058/2059.

<sup>41</sup> Dhungel (no date) *Engendering Nepalese Civil Service* and PSC Op cit.

<sup>42</sup> See Table 2 of Appendix 1 for details. At the time of the RGA, results for the latest civil service examination were not available.

<sup>43</sup> RRP: NEP 32238.

<sup>44</sup> Percentages are calculated from figures supplied by Kitab Khana by email on 4/6/2003, based on 77,955 computerised personnel records (compared with a total of 86,000 civil servants in June 2004). MOH has a total of 4211 female employees compared with a total of 7140 female civil servants on the database in June 2004. There are 461 females employed in MOAC, compared with a total of 8718 staff. 152 of MOAC's 3915 Junior Technical Assistant and Junior Technicians are women. MOGA has 16 (7%) female staff out of a total of 240 civil servants included on the database.

<sup>45</sup> The recent approval by the cabinet did not mention the exact percentage to be reserved. Currently there are around 86,000 civil servants, with 77,955 entered on the personnel database (Interview, Kitab Khana, 26/5/2004.) If the vacancy rate is 5% per year (an arbitrary estimate), then 4300 would be retiring per year. If women are appointed to 20% of these 4300 vacancies, an additional 860 women would be appointed. Currently, 9% of the civil service are women (approximately 7740). After appointing 20% women to new vacancies, there would be 8600 women (7740 + 860). Assuming the civil service stayed at the current level of 86,000 this would mean that there would be 10% women in the civil service, an increase of 1%. If the overall size of the civil service is reduced, as is assumed by GRP, then the rate of increase of women would be greater. If new vacancies are fewer than 5% per year, then the percentage rate of increase of women would be lower.

not to mention legitimizing and rewarding women who have worked in the field for nearly 20 years. At the time the RGA was done, there was a stalemate on these initiatives, both of which will require amendments to the civil service act.

#### Percentage of Women in the Civil Service (1978–2004)

Positions	1978	1993	June 1999	2001	June 2004
Gazetted Officers	3.23	4.39	5.16	5.12	5.20
Special and First (Policy Level)	1.00	2.31	4.87	4.02	1.79
Second	2.49	4.48	3.16	5.04	3.78
Third	3.66	4.54	5.24	5.34	5.82
Non-Gazetted (Support Staff)	2.37	n/a	8.2	8.93	9.55
Total	2.62	n/a	7.81	8.55	9.16

n/a: not available

Sources: Data from 1978 to 2001 was reported in RRP: NEP 32238: 72. Data for 2004 is from the newly computerized personnel records provided by *Kitab Khana*, and is based on 77,955 current entries in the database. (The total number of civil servants in June 2004 was over 86,000.)

There are significant differences of opinion on whether or not the current public service commission (PSC) examination system is gender neutral. Similarly, some government stakeholders strongly assert that the civil service already has a merit-based approach to recruitment and promotion whereas others highlight the exclusion of women and disadvantaged and ethnic groups as a key area requiring reform. Little action appears to have been taken on personnel assessment and grievance procedures though a cabinet decision after the RGA provided for written staff performance evaluations every 4 months.

Several nonmonetary benefits were introduced in 1998, and the road map proposed additional benefits such as civil service awards and scholarships for women, childcare centers, flexible working hours, and increasing the age limit for women entering the civil service. Stakeholders believe these have had little impact given other constraints to women's employment. A MOGA consultant's report is expected on further measures to create a favorable environment for women in the civil service. The recent cabinet decision also noted that a model childcare center would be established in Kathmandu and that male employees would receive 11 days of paternity leave a maximum of twice during their careers.

Although consultants have already done a considerable amount of work on gender mainstreaming,<sup>46</sup> there is still a lack of stakeholder collaboration and consensus. During the RGA, there were three separate, ongoing activities: a high-level reservation committee chaired by MOF; MOGA consultant working on promoting gender mainstreaming; and a team of consultants financed by the United Kingdom's Department for International Development working on

<sup>46</sup> ADB. 2002. *Institutional Support for Governance Reform: Gender Mainstreaming*.

affirmative action in the civil service. Moreover, while the RRP highlighted the need for rightsizing plans to narrow the gap between women and men in the civil service, this gender sensitive language was dropped in the road map, and there is no evidence that rightsizing is achieving that goal. On the contrary, the government's commitment to rightsizing was noted as a constraint to increasing the numbers of female JTs and JTAs in MOAC.

On the positive side, the road map includes a commitment to increasing the number of women at policy- and decision-making levels by ensuring that there is one woman in each ministry in class I and class II positions. This was reinforced by the recent cabinet decision, although it reserved only one such post.<sup>47</sup> This is important for equity. Appointments at these levels will have to be made by lateral entry due to the low-level positions women hold in the civil service. This will also require legislative amendments to the civil service act that are not yet in place.

The CSSP established six citizen monitoring cells (CMCs) that were 16% women. There were no gender provisions in the project design for this subcomponent. More effort is needed to ensure that CMCs actively involve women and address gender issues in local advocacy and in monitoring government service delivery at the district level. Other results so far include two posters illustrating rights to government services. These are gender sensitive showing women and men in positive, active, decision-making roles.

### **3. Sustainability**

It is too soon to assess the sustainability of gender provisions and the potential benefits that may flow from them; however, it is clear that owning and understanding the gender mainstreaming approach are critical.

- Technical assistance reports have presented a huge range of recommendations on gender mainstreaming and on many other aspects of governance reform. While there does appear to be some high-level commitment to gender mainstreaming, the challenge is to find practical and feasible ways forward that are owned and implemented by the range of government stakeholders. So far, there are many action plans, but few have been implemented.
- Advocacy for and monitoring of reforms by the CSSP and by the independent CMCs have the potential to significantly enhance the sustainability of all GRP benefits and outcomes by tracking progress on gender provisions and by networking with both internal and external stakeholders committed to advancing women's rights.

### **4. Contribution of Gender Provisions to Overall Loan Objectives**

Much of the focus on gender mainstreaming in the GRP has been on an affirmative action policy and program to increase the number of women in the civil service including in senior positions. Cabinet approval of a reservation policy is a very important first step.

---

<sup>47</sup> *The Kathmandu Post*, 24 September 2004.

Ensuring that women's needs are met in line ministries at the local level (component 5) will contribute directly to the goal of creating a civil service that is both results and people oriented and that thereby contributes to higher economic growth and poverty reduction. Gender mainstreaming in performance management is critical for ensuring that the GRP offers equal access to resources and benefits for both women and men from all social groups at the district level. This is one area where gender focal points could potentially play a very useful role. MOWCSW's request to line agencies to ensure that women are included in decision making at local levels (for example in village development committees and their user committees) also has potential to help achieve overall loan objectives.<sup>48</sup>

#### D. Challenges

Much of the discussion above highlights risks, challenges, and missed opportunities in implementation.

- ⇒ **Ownership and consensus:** Gender provisions in the loan design were understood and owned by key stakeholders during loan design; however, there is a significant gap between policy and practice. Even where there is high-level commitment to gender provisions in the road map, there is disagreement about how they should be implemented, and the pace of change is slow. Leadership is required to provide a clear policy framework for addressing social and gender equality issues and to translate commitments into action.
- ⇒ **Gender focal points:** The requirements of the policy conditions have been exceeded by identifying gender focal points in the five ministries and a gender unit in MOGA, however stakeholders agree that gender focal points lack adequate resources and guidelines. (Resources mentioned by stakeholders included budget; office hardware such as fax machines, computers, and phones; training; and guidelines on how to integrate gender analysis and planning into their ministries.) Some stakeholders believe that gender focal points lack the capacity and commitment to do their jobs well due to inadequate training, frequent transfers, and the fact that some did not choose this position. Others focus on the inability of gender focal points to intervene in policy and program decision making due to a lack of seniority. Monthly meetings to encourage networking and learning among gender focal points do not appear to have taken place.
- ⇒ **Improving performance of the civil service at the district level:** GRP's role in enhancing performance management at local levels is poorly defined, and it is unclear whether stakeholders see the relevance of gender mainstreaming in the performance management component (component 5). The technical assistance

---

<sup>48</sup> Most sectors have their own policies regarding women's representation in community/user groups. For instance, government norms require a minimum of 33% women in irrigation committees, 35% in agriculture and livestock groups, and 40% in the drinking water sector. In ADB-assisted projects, executing agencies and Nepal resident mission officers are actively monitoring and enforcing these policies, particularly project managers who have received gender training.

report recommended that the performance management system include a budget and program for gender mainstreaming, but this was not picked up in the government's road map.<sup>49</sup> CSSP can potentially play a role here by ensuring that CMCs monitor equal access to government resources and benefits for women and men.

### **E. Factors Influencing the Achievement of Gender Equality Results**

While it is too early to assess achievements, it is possible to identify factors that have influenced progress to date.

- ⇒ **Gender equality loan conditions:** Linking gender equality conditions to the release of funds gave political legitimacy to gender mainstreaming. ADB's monitoring of gender provisions and tranche conditions during loan review missions provided an ongoing incentive for the government to develop a consensus on gender mainstreaming approaches. Systematic follow-up is needed by ADB to ensure that gender provisions and cabinet decisions are implemented.
- ⇒ **Linking gender provisions to the project goal:** Including a reference to gender responsiveness in the project goal provided a strong incentive to CSSP to address gender issues from the very beginning even though there were no specific gender provisions related to this aspect of the project.<sup>50</sup>
- ⇒ **Involvement of NRM gender specialist:** The involvement of the specialist in loan design was critical for ensuring that gender equality issues were included, that they were owned by relevant staff (some of whom have since been transferred to other ministries), and for including MOWCSW in consultations during loan design and appraisal. ADB's support for gender mainstreaming approaches has raised the level of debate and has improved the likelihood that further steps will be taken by the government on both gender and social equity issues. This has reinforced and supported the efforts of civil society groups and other stakeholders.
- ⇒ **External and internal support/pressure for gender equality:** Stakeholders agree that progress made in dialogue on gender equality has been due to both internal commitments in sections of the government and external pressure from various elements of civil society and donor groups. A strong coalition of stakeholders (including MOGA, ADB, MOWCSW, and CSSP) is needed to ensure that gender provisions are implemented.

### **F. Recommendations**

(i) Systematic and consistent follow-up are needed to ensure that provisions recently approved by the cabinet are implemented in a timely manner. Bureaucratic resistance to affirmative action policies was identified as a risk in the RRP as was a lack of recognition of gender as a central issue on the governance reform agenda. These risks need to be assertively managed by

---

<sup>49</sup> ADB. 2003. Op. cit.

<sup>50</sup> This was verified in interviews with CSSP staff.

MOGA and ADB. Bringing together a coalition of internal and external stakeholders may help to address some of the challenges and stalemates discussed above.

(ii) Consideration should be given to establishing a gender unit within CSSP. CSSP and CMCs play a dual role of advocating and educating the public about the reform process and of monitoring governance reform efforts at central and local levels. This is a very positive feature of the project’s design that could be strengthened by increasing the capacity of CSSP to monitor the implementation of gender mainstreaming initiatives. The role of a gender unit would be to:

- assist CMCs and strengthen their capacity to involve women and to advocate for and monitor social and gender equality issues in the local delivery of public services;
- provide more in-depth monitoring information and analysis of the government’s action on gender equality in all components of the GRP.

(iii) The ADB gender specialist should provide support to MOGA to consolidate ownership and commitment, to build consensus on ways to implement commitments, and to increase the effectiveness of gender focal points. A concerted effort is needed by all stakeholders to address the challenges outlined above. CSSP and MOWCSW also have an important role to play. For example, guidance and direction on gender mainstreaming is needed for gender focal points in ministry change units. Monthly meetings of gender focal points initiated by MOGA and attended by MOWCSW, CSSP, and ADB would be a starting point to provide an opportunity for sharing strategies and problem solving and to identify capacity development needs. It is particularly important that gender focal points have necessary resources and that they have high-level support. Once a basic level of gender training has been undertaken, capacity development should focus on specific tasks relevant to each line ministry and sector.

<p><b>Box 4. Governance Reform Program: Recommendations</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• MOGA and ADB must follow-up on cabinet provisions to ensure they are implemented in a timely manner.</li> <li>• A gender unit in the Civil Society Support Program would be beneficial.</li> <li>• The ADB gender specialist should work with MOGA to increase the effectiveness of gender focal points and to ensure that commitments are implemented.</li> <li>• Gender mainstreaming must be addressed in loan component 5.</li> </ul>
--

(iv) MOGA, with support from ADB, CSSP, and MOWCSW, should ensure that gender mainstreaming is adequately addressed in component 5 on performance management and is improved at the local level by developing gender strategies and indicators for new service standards and by using performance incentive funds. Gender-sensitive indicators need to be developed with stakeholders but could include:

- equal access for males and females to services and benefits provided by the three line ministries (MOAC, MOES, and MOH) at local levels;
- all data on service provision disaggregated by sex, ethnicity, and caste to monitor progress on government norms and policies on the involvement of women and

disadvantaged groups possibly incorporated into GRP's review of systems and processes for improving performance;

- service standards take into account both male and female needs, roles, responsibilities, and access to resources and services as appropriate in each sector (agriculture, education and health);
- adequate procedures for making complaints at the local level for both males and females;
- criteria for eligibility for performance improvement funds that include gender sensitive indicators such as steps taken to increase the proportion of women employed, the participation of beneficiary or client groups including women in decision making about service delivery and benefits, provision of gender training to local staff, and the other indicators noted above.

## Chapter 4

# Teacher Education Project

### A. Project Description

The overall objective of TEP<sup>51</sup> is to assist the government to improve the quality and efficiency of basic education by providing better-qualified teachers. The specific objectives are to improve the quality and coverage of teacher training by building institutional capacity for a system that encompasses pre-service, in-service, and recurrent training of primary school teachers and to improve access for girls and other disadvantaged groups.<sup>52</sup> The executing agency for the loan is the Ministry of Education and Sports (MOES). The project is implemented by the National Centre for Education Development (NCED).<sup>53</sup> Project objectives are to be achieved through four components.<sup>54</sup>

- (i) **Build an effective and sustainable system for teacher education:** The aim is to build capacity for policy making, for planning, and for managing teacher training programs.
- (ii) **Develop effective teacher education curriculum and materials:** The focus is on strengthening teaching skills by providing more effective, participatory, activity-based training that is linked to school practices. Activities include developing training-of-trainer (TOT) manuals, trainer's guides, and resource materials that support the implementation of the revised teacher training curricula and developing a culture and gender sensitization training package.
- (iii) **Provide teacher and management training:** This component provides a range of in-service and pre-service training packages for teachers and management training for Department of Education officials, school principals, regional education directors, school supervisors, and district education officers. Mobile training units will be used in remote areas.
- (iv) **Serve girls and other disadvantaged groups:** The aim is to create awareness among teachers and administrators on the extent and nature of discrimination and of ways to minimize discrimination and enhance the self-esteem of girls and children from disadvantaged groups. A total of 2,500 scholarships for 10 months of pre-service training will be awarded to candidates from disadvantaged groups

---

<sup>51</sup> Loan 1840-NEP: Teacher Education Project, approved 24 September 2001 for \$25.9 million. Loan became effective: 9 May 2002.

<sup>52</sup> RRP: NEP 32236.

<sup>53</sup> Ibid.

<sup>54</sup> Ibid.

from 12 targeted districts, at least 75% of whom are expected to be females.<sup>55</sup> Training in culture and in gender sensitization will be delivered in the same 12 districts. School support groups will be established and a pilot tutorial program for disadvantaged children will be launched utilizing trained scholarship awardees in their home districts.

## **B. Social and Gender Analysis and Provisions in the Loan Design**

There was no formal gender action plan prepared during loan design,<sup>56</sup> however three strategies for addressing social equity and gender issues were included. Social and gender analysis focused on the lower enrolment, retention, and achievement rates for children from low-income families and for girls.<sup>57</sup> The first strategy for addressing this problem is to increase the proportion of female teachers and teachers from disadvantaged groups in primary education by providing 2,500 scholarships and by giving priority to females and disadvantaged groups for the 3,000 teaching vacancies that occur annually due to attrition.<sup>58</sup> However, no overall targets were set for recruiting females or people from disadvantaged groups based on government advice that there would be legal impediments.<sup>59</sup>

Educating teachers to better serve the needs of disadvantaged groups and girls is the second strategy identified in the project. Overall improvements in the quality of education will be achieved by training teachers (which should improve educational outcomes for both boys and girls) and by integrating the culture and gender sensitization module into regular in-service and pre-service teacher training packages and into training for administrators.

Lessons learned indicate that changes in classroom practices and behavior cannot occur without systematic and consistent follow-up, monitoring, and on-site support of teachers.<sup>60</sup> While the loan does provide for training school supervisors in the 12 targeted disadvantaged districts using the culture and gender sensitization module, there are no provisions to strengthen supervision

---

<sup>55</sup> His Majesty's Government of Nepal National Centre for Educational Development (*Benefit, Monitoring and Evaluation: Concepts and Base Line*) July 2003. The target of 75% females is a benefit indicator for the project.

<sup>56</sup> The gender specialist from the Nepal resident mission was not a member of the design mission and had no direct inputs into the RRP. However, she did contribute to a discussion on gender and culture issues and recommended that some gender provisions be included as loan covenants.

<sup>57</sup> RRP: NEP 32236.

<sup>58</sup> Ibid.

<sup>59</sup> Similarly, no targets have been set in the Education For All (EFA) Program which sets out a comprehensive program for all areas of the basic and primary education subsector. However, EFA highlights the importance of affirmative action and provides for an incentive payment of NRs 5000 per year to rural schools that recruit 50% of either female or *dalit* teachers. MOES. 2003. *Education For All 2004 – 2009 Core Document*.

<sup>60</sup> RRP: NEP 32236

and no plans for monitoring this aspect of teaching quality. (It should be noted, however, that NCED does not manage supervisors.)<sup>61</sup>

The need to involve parents in efforts to improve school management is another important lesson drawn from earlier projects. The girls' education promotion program<sup>62</sup> is the third strategy included in the loan design for addressing social and gender equality issues. This subcomponent was not defined in detail in the project design and is still being formulated. Current plans include training in culture and gender sensitivity at the district level to be followed by the establishment and training of school support groups (SSGs) as subcommittees of school management committees in two schools from each of seven targeted disadvantaged districts (14 schools/SSGs in total).<sup>63</sup> SSGs are expected to raise awareness in the community about the importance of education for both girls and boys from *janjati* and *dalit* groups (ethnic groups and lower castes). SSGs will be provided with limited financial support to assist with meetings, materials, and workshops. Additional activities to be included in the program will be discussed during the next ADB loan review mission to ensure that there is complementarity with the government's Education For All Program (EFA) for basic and primary education from 2004 to 2009.<sup>64</sup>

Three loan covenants in the RRP and project administration memorandum were related to these gender provisions.

- Criteria for selecting candidates for international training are to include guidelines for encouraging eligible females.
- Mobile training units established by primary teacher training centers (PTTCs) are to include at least one female trainer as well as trainers from the target group.
- "MOES will take all necessary measures to increase the number of female teachers and teachers from other disadvantaged groups..." by recruiting candidates from districts where there are vacancies and by strictly implementing regulations that each school is to have at least one female teacher.<sup>65</sup>

### C. Discussion of Achievements and Progress

The most significant achievements have been the development of a 2-day gender and culture sensitization package and the satisfactory attention given to gender and social equity issues

---

<sup>61</sup> EFA acknowledges the importance of supervision, and presents opportunities for strengthening it in schools through school improvement plans. MOES. 2003. Op. cit.

<sup>62</sup> RRP: NEP 32236.

<sup>63</sup> In the initial phase of implementation, NCED plans to work in seven targeted districts (rather than 12 as planned in the RRP) due to civil disturbances and inability to travel to the remaining districts due to the Maoist insurgency. The seven districts targeted for these programs are Sunsari, Mahottari, Sindhupalchok, Tanahun, Myagdi, Banke, and Surkhet.

<sup>64</sup> During the rapid gender assessment, NCED advised of plans to provide material support to 84 girls from disadvantaged groups and to develop a tutorial program also targeted at girls utilizing the first batch of female fellowship holders in their home villages as tutors. These plans will be discussed during the next ADB loan review mission.

<sup>65</sup> RRP: NEP 32236.

in the teacher training curricula reviewed by the RGA. TEP has provided equal opportunity for in-service training for female teachers (roughly in proportion to their representation in the workforce). The scholarship program for pre-service training for disadvantaged groups has also successfully targeted women.

Due to the delayed start of the project,<sup>66</sup> it has been difficult to assess other results and benefits because various gender and social equity provisions in the loan design are either just beginning to be implemented or are still in the formulation stage. Progress is summarized in Box 5 (see Appendix 1 Table 3 for details) and discussed below.

### **1. Individual and Community Benefits**

Meetings with teachers and teacher trainees demonstrate that women are very aware of the constraints they face both in their work and in balancing their domestic and professional responsibilities. Some female in-service trainees said that cultural expectations for women persist at work and gave examples. Based on these discussions, it seems likely that trainees will be able to identify discrimination and might possibly speak out against it. Due to some extent to TEP training, many will be good role models for girls in their communities whether or not they are appointed as teachers.

In-service trainees were asked whether their training would help to change attitudes of male teachers towards female teachers. In-service trainees at Kavre PTTC were skeptical and noted that male colleagues who had had the first phase of training still did not treat female teachers as equal colleagues. Changing attitudes is a long-term process, however. The new training package on gender and cultural sensitivity is a promising initiative that will help teachers, officials, and community members to recognize and discuss discrimination based on gender, ethnicity, language, and caste and will create a more enabling environment for female teachers and students from disadvantaged groups.

The participation of female teachers in in-service training ranges between 24–47% (see Appendix 1). This is satisfactory taking into account the fact that only 21% of the 78,552 teachers in the public system are female. In all, 15% of female teachers are fully trained compared with 17% of teachers in the public system as a whole.<sup>67</sup> Nevertheless, the percentage of female pre-service trainees (currently 45%) should be higher given the importance of increasing the proportion of female teachers in the project's rationale and strategy. Sex-disaggregated data are not routinely included in progress reports or in ADB back-to-office reports.

---

<sup>66</sup> Interview with Nepal resident mission project implementation officer, 24<sup>th</sup> May 2004. While loan disbursement and implementation were satisfactory during 2003/2004, 38% of loan time had elapsed with a total disbursement at the end of April 2004 of only 9%.

<sup>67</sup> His Majesty's Government of Nepal National Centre for Educational Development. 2003. (*Teacher Education Project – Benefit, Monitoring and Evaluation: Concepts and Base Line*).

**Box 5: Teacher Education Project: Summary of Gender Equality Results**

Project Component	Progress on Gender Equality Results
Objective: improve access to primary schooling for girls	⇒ Programs for increasing girls' access are just beginning to be formulated.
Female staff to be encouraged to apply for international training	⇒ Criteria for international training are in draft form. No targets have been set. No overseas training has been undertaken yet. Sex-disaggregated data on staff development are not available.
Culture and gender sensitization elements to be incorporated into teacher training curricula	⇒ Of three teacher training documents reviewed, two give satisfactory attention to gender issues. ⇒ Instructors report that about 1 day is spent on culture and gender sensitization issues in each teacher-training package. The focus is on how teacher behavior needs to change to ensure that all students are treated equally.
Culture and gender sensitization package developed	⇒ A 2-day package has been developed. Two training-of-trainer guides were assessed. The coverage of gender and cultural diversity issues is good.
Teacher and management training ■ Mobile training units	⇒ The percentage of females receiving in-service training ranges from 7% (for school principals) to 47% (basic in-service). ⇒ Sex-disaggregated data are not available for some training. ⇒ One female is included in each mobile training unit.
2,500 scholarships for disadvantaged groups for pre-service training, 75% female	⇒ Of the first batch of 193 scholarships for 10 months of pre-service training, 100% were awarded to women from <i>dalit</i> and other disadvantaged groups
Provision of training in gender and cultural sensitization	⇒ Training of trainers (15 men and 1 women) was done. NCED plans to conduct district training with stakeholders and school support groups.
Girls' education promotion program	⇒ Plans for this subcomponent are still being formulated.
Increase the number of female teachers using priority recruitment	⇒ There is no guarantee that women provided with scholarships for pre-service training will be employed to fill the 3,000 teacher vacancies available annually.

Stakeholders were not convinced that female scholarship holders from disadvantaged groups would be able to get jobs as teachers. Various constraints (including nepotism) to their appointments by school management committees under new arrangements for decentralization were identified. The data in Appendix 3 show that the proportion of female teachers in the 12 TEP districts increased from 20% in 2001 to 21% in 2002. While this brought the districts as a whole up to the national average, the 1% increase in female teachers compares with an overall increase in teacher numbers of 11% across all 12 districts. Moreover, progress across the districts was patchy. Five districts showed a decrease in the proportion of female teachers, even if overall teacher numbers increased substantially.<sup>68</sup> Only 3 of the 12 districts increased the proportion of female teachers. The remaining 4 retained the same proportion of female teachers from 2001 to 2002 despite overall increases in teacher numbers in 3 of these districts.

These figures suggest that stakeholders' skepticism is justified. The progress of scholarship holders will need to be closely monitored. Affirmative action provisions in the new EFA program are cause for optimism as are plans for making appointments fully transparent.<sup>69</sup>

NCED's plan to train school management committees and other local stakeholders in gender issues is a promising initiative. So too is the plan to establish school support groups to strengthen and monitor efforts to keep girls in schools. However, the overall impact compared with the total loan investment will be very small, with only two schools targeted in each of seven districts.<sup>70</sup>

## **2. Sustainability**

It is difficult to say much about sustainability given the early stage of project implementation. Nevertheless, it is clear that both its impact and sustainability will be significantly enhanced if TEP's efforts to address social and gender equality issues are undertaken within the general framework of the EFA program which outlines an overall strategy for basic and primary education.

## **3. Contribution of Gender Provisions to Overall Loan Objectives**

Stakeholders have pointed out that improving access to primary education for girls and other disadvantaged groups (one of two project objectives) requires a range of other donor inputs. This is acknowledged. It is also true that TEP's role is critical to the government's overall efforts to improve primary school access and outcomes by ensuring that teachers are well equipped to create an enabling environment for all children to attend and to achieve at school and by contributing to an increase in the proportion of female primary teachers.

---

<sup>68</sup> For example, overall teacher numbers in Dang, Surkhet, and Doti districts increased by 34%, 41% and 31% respectively, but the proportion of female teachers decreased by 4%, 3%, and 2% in those districts.

<sup>69</sup> MOES. 2003. Op. cit.

<sup>70</sup> Only seven districts are currently targeted instead of the 12 identified in the RRP due to security issues associated with the Maoist insurgency.

#### D. Factors Influencing the Achievement of Gender Equality Results

As with GRP, it is too early to assess the achievement of most results. Positive factors that have promoted progress so far include the following.

- ⇒ **Linking gender provisions to the project goal:** The specific project objective and component addressing social and gender equality issues are undoubtedly a positive feature in the design even though some aspects of component 4 are still to be formulated.
- ⇒ **Setting targets:** Providing 2,500 scholarships to disadvantaged groups from 12 targeted districts (75% to go to women) is a very positive initiative that could have a significant impact as long as the recipients are actually appointed as teachers.
- ⇒ **Supportive policy context:** The strong focus in the EFA program on gender and social equity will also promote positive results in TEP particularly the provision of incentives to schools that conform to TEP's target of appointing 50% female or *dalit* teachers and to the government's policy that one female teacher should be appointed per primary school.<sup>71</sup>
- ⇒ **Project-specific gender action plan:** Gender provisions that have been fully developed and implemented have delivered good results so far. To maximize benefits and the potential to achieve overall project objectives, a comprehensive and systematic approach is needed to ensure that gender issues are fully addressed in all project components.
- ⇒ **Gender specialist on the project team:** Long-term, in-house expertise is needed to develop, implement, and monitor gender provisions.

#### E. Recommendations

(i) A GAP should be formulated as soon as possible. While gender strategies and provisions were included in the loan design, the component on serving girls was not formulated in detail. Targets were not set for staff development or for overall teacher training. While there is a loan covenant related to increased recruitment of female teachers, there are currently inadequate strategies in place to ensure this happens. The GAP needs to address each of the following areas.

(ii) Future activities for the girls' education promotion program should contribute to the national EFA strategy and should be formulated with input from ADB's gender specialist. The government's EFA program outlines a comprehensive approach for addressing social and gender equality issues in basic and primary education and for eliminating gender disparities in access and outcomes.<sup>72</sup> For example, while TEP's plan to establish school support groups has potential in principle, this initiative will have limited impact unless it is linked to the EFA's plans for a massive community mobilization campaign. EFA will support decentralized school governance through school improvement plans as the major tool for improving access, quality, and management of

<sup>71</sup> MOES. 2003. *Education For All 2004 – 2009 Core Document*.

<sup>72</sup> MOES. 2003. *Ibid*.

primary education. It is important that new structures to be established under TEP (such as school support groups) complement or contribute to EFA.

(iii) A tracer study on scholarship recipients and a preliminary assessment of the impact of the program should be done as part of the project's mid-term review including the proportion of scholarship holders who have been appointed as teachers and whether any further support or mentoring is needed. The progress of the 2,500 scholarship awardees from disadvantaged groups must be closely monitored and compared with progress and outcomes of other pre-service teacher candidates (male and female). Progress, constraints, and positive factors supporting successful outcomes should be monitored both during and after training.

(iv) The mid-term review should monitor the recruitment of female teachers in TEP's 12 targeted districts and should investigate constraints, positive factors, and strategies that support the appointment of female teachers in those districts.

(v) Sex-disaggregated data should be provided in all progress reports for all types of training provided by the project, including teacher training, management training, and all staff development for NECD, PTTCs, and district education officers. This is essential for assessing benefits and the effectiveness of targeting strategies. ADB reports should also ensure that all data is disaggregated by sex.

(vi) The mid-term review should investigate the impact on teaching practice of the culture and gender sensitization aspects of the in-service and pre-service teacher training curricula. Supervision and ongoing support are critical to changing teachers' classroom behavior.

(vii) The 2-day culture and gender sensitization module should be included in all pre-service and in-service primary teacher-training packages. It is not enough to rely on the goodwill or commitment of individual trainers to incorporate this material into their teacher training. It was not possible to assess all NCED's training packages due to time and language constraints. As a general rule, specific content and examples on gender and cultural sensitivity are also needed in trainers' guides and resource materials for teachers.

(viii) Consideration should be given to the appointment of a long-term social and gender specialist for NCED. An NCED gender specialist could contribute to continuous quality

**Box 6. Teacher Education Project:  
Recommendations**

- A comprehensive gender action plan should be developed as soon as possible.
- The girls' education promotion program should contribute to the national Education For All strategy.
- The mid-term review should assess the effectiveness of the scholarship program and in-service and pre-service courses and should determine what measures are successful in hiring female teachers.
- The 2-day culture and gender sensitization module should be included in all pre-service and in-service training packages.
- Data in all reports should be sex-disaggregated.
- A long-term gender specialist at the National Center for Education Development would be beneficial.
- The ADB gender specialist should take part in the next loan review mission.

improvement in teacher training materials and training programs for NCED, PTTCs, and the distance education center. A gender specialist could also play an important role in monitoring gender equality impacts of the project including the girls' education promotion program, in tracking the progress of the 2,500 scholarship holders from disadvantaged groups, and in mentoring and supporting scholarship holders if necessary.

(ix) ADB's gender specialist should be involved in the next loan review mission to advise on strategies for the girls' education program and to assist with the development of an overall GAP for the project. The gender specialist should also be involved in the mid-term review.



## *Chapter 5*

# Findings

This chapter summarizes experiences from all three projects to assess whether GAPs and gender strategies and provisions improved implementation, outreach, and results for women. The following questions are discussed.

- What types of approaches were used to address gender equality issues during loan design and implementation?
- How did these approaches affect results?
- How effective have GAPs and gender strategies and provisions been at improving implementation, outreach, and results for women? Is it possible to compare the effectiveness of GAPs as a tool for gender mainstreaming with other approaches? What elements of GAPs and gender strategies and provisions make them more effective?
- How important is the role of a local gender specialist in achieving desired results?
- What other external and institutional factors have played an important role in achieving results for women?

### **A. Approaches to Addressing Gender Equality: Gender Action Plans and Gender Strategies and Provisions**

A GAP was introduced at the mid-term review of TLDP based on sound gender analysis and participation of stakeholders. Gender strategies were developed for most project components to focus the executing agency on delivering results for women and the poor. TLDP had significant inputs from the ADB gender specialist during preparation and implementation of the GAP. Considerable attention was given to capacity building for gender sensitive planning and implementation in the executing agency and with district stakeholders both formally (through workshops and training) and informally (for example, through district problem-solving meetings for local staff and stakeholders). The GAP had clear links to the overall project goal of reducing poverty, and these links were understood by the project team. The GAP was fully owned by the executing agency and included inputs from its gender specialist. Gender-sensitive criteria were used to select NGOs to ensure that social mobilization activities were appropriate and effective for engaging women in CBOs. Partnerships were developed and consolidated with local advocates for gender equality, particularly district WDOs and NGOs. It was possible to compare results for women before and after the introduction of the GAP as TLDP was nearing completion at the time of the RGA.

GRP has no formal GAP. Nevertheless, loan assurances and tranche release conditions linked to gender equality policy and provisions have elevated gender and social equity to the level of serious policy dialogue between ADB and the government. This has also encouraged further public debate on gender issues supported by the efforts of both internal and external stakeholders. These are major achievements for program/policy loans of this nature. The loan design includes significant gender provisions for some components with missed opportunities in others (CSSP and improving service delivery at local level). The ADB gender specialist facilitated revisions to the loan design to improve attention to gender issues but has not been closely involved in monitoring or implementation. Gender focal points (who may not be gender specialists) have been identified in the executing agency and in four other ministries involved in implementation, but they have not been given adequate training and resources and have not been supported to play key roles in implementation. While stakeholders show some policy commitment to gender provisions, lack of ownership, bureaucratic resistance, and lack of understanding of their relevance are serious risks to achieving both equal benefits for women and the overall project goal. Systematic follow-up and monitoring are needed to ensure that all gender provisions are implemented in a timely manner.

TEP, like GRP, has no formal GAP, but the loan design includes a separate component to address unequal access to education and gaps in achievements of girls and disadvantaged groups in addition to significant gender provisions in other components. Nevertheless, gender strategies for implementing the girls' education promotion program were ill defined in the loan design as were strategies for increasing the recruitment of female teachers. Targets for female participation in project activities were not systematically set. Loan assurances have not been directly linked with gender strategies though some significant gender capacity-building efforts have been undertaken at central and local levels. The ADB gender specialist was not involved in loan design or implementation. A GAP could maximize benefits from this investment.

## **B. Summary of Gender Equality Results Achieved**

Women's participation in TLDP activities increased markedly due to the GAP and exceeded MOAC targets. This also resulted in significantly increased participation of the poor in livestock CBOs. Similarly, TEP has achieved reasonable levels of participation of women in training activities even though this has not been routinely monitored. Women have participated in GRP coaching classes but have not increased their employment in the civil service.

Women's access to resources such as technology, training, and services provided by a range of other agencies also increased significantly in TLDP and is an excellent achievement. While women's access to credit increased, men's benefits from credit continue to far exceed those of women. Results were limited due to institutional constraints (bank rules regarding credit) and social/cultural constraints that limited progress in adding value to women's labor through agroprocessing. In TEP, women have increased access to resources through the scholarships, but further work will be needed to ensure that this translates into increased access to employment as teachers. GRP has the potential to increase women's access to services and benefits from line ministries at local levels but only if gender strategies are further developed and implemented.

The practical benefits to women from TLDP since the introduction of the GAP are significant including better livelihood options, increased income, reduced workloads, and increased financial security as a result of their savings activities. GRP and TEP both also have the potential to deliver practical benefits to women through increased employment opportunities; however, as noted previously, these results depend on the successful development and implementation of gender strategies.

There is some evidence of strategic changes in gender relations due to TLDP activities. This includes increased acceptance of new roles for women (through their membership in farmer groups), increased decision making (relating to credit and women's involvement in livestock planning), and increased likelihood of women taking collective action to solve community problems and to access information and services.

The cabinet's recent approval of a policy reserving places for women in the civil service is a major policy achievement that contributes to an enabling environment for future strategic gains. Gender and social equity issues are now legitimate subjects for debate at high levels in Nepal. These are major strategic changes that have been reinforced by ADB's focus on gender issues in the loan design for GRP including the use of tranche release conditions. There is potential for further change if this policy is implemented.

TEP also has the potential to reinforce strategic changes in gender relations through its focus on gender and social equity in primary teacher training curricula. If women who receive pre-service training scholarships are appointed to teaching positions in disadvantaged rural areas, this will be an important strategic gain which can be expected to have a positive impact on girls' access to education and on their educational achievements.

### **C. The Effectiveness of Gender Action Plans and Gender Strategies**

There is no doubt that GAP strategies have improved implementation, outreach, and results for women and the poor in TLDP as demonstrated by comparing them before and after the mid-term review. TLDP's GAP has clearly been a useful and effective tool not only for gender mainstreaming but also for achieving the project's goal of poverty reduction and for enhancing the sustainability of benefits.

Comparing the effectiveness of TLDP's GAP with the approaches of TEP and GRP must take into account the different phases of implementation of the latter two projects. TLDP was nearing completion when the RGA was done. The TEP and GRP loans were approved in late 2001 and though they have been active for more than 2 years, both experienced delays in implementation.

It is clear that TLDP took a more systematic approach to addressing gender equality than GRP or TEP did due mainly to its GAP. In contrast, TEP's and GRP's approaches without GAPs are more limited, ad hoc, and piecemeal.

Nonetheless, the gender provisions in the TEP loan design could potentially yield positive benefits for women if a comprehensive gender action plan is developed and implemented. As a program/policy loan, GRP uses a different lending modality. Nevertheless, it is clear that further gender strategies should be developed and a more comprehensive approach should be taken to ensure that potentially positive benefits for women are realized.

A number of elements make gender action plans and gender strategies more effective. Among them are the following.

### **1. Linking Gender Strategies to Project Objectives**

All three projects refer to gender equality or gender issues in their goals or objectives. This reinforces the legitimacy of focusing on equal participation and benefits for women and acts as a strong incentive to address gender issues even where no gender provisions or strategies are identified for specific components as is the case with the CSSP of GRP.

### **2. Ownership of Gender Strategies**

Ownership was a strong factor in the success of TLDP's GAP due to the participatory and flexible approach used in developing it. It is also one of the challenges in GRP. References to gender issues in the goal or objectives provide an important "hook" and rationale for addressing women's needs, but it is also very important that this link to higher order objectives be understood and owned by project staff and stakeholders. In TLDP, the link between meeting women's needs and reducing poverty was strong and well understood whereas in GRP it appears that some stakeholders do not understand the links between a gender-responsive civil service, good governance, and the local delivery of equal benefits and services.

### **3. Good Gender Analysis**

A comprehensive gender analysis is needed to identify constraints to women's participation and benefits and to develop strategies to address these constraints in all project components and activities. This is a strength in TLDP's GAP but a weakness in those areas of GRP where gender issues still need to be addressed (CSSP and improving civil service performance at local levels).

### **4. Realistic and Mandatory Targets, Monitoring, and Loan Covenants**

GRP is a good practice example of linking gender equality policy conditions to tranche releases in policy/program loans. This is an outcome of the policy dialogue between ADB and the government that leveraged high-level national support for important strategic policy gains. Delays in implementation reinforce the importance of constant follow up and stakeholder support to ensure that gender equality policies are understood, owned, and implemented.

Loan assurances and covenants improve the likelihood of monitoring that is essential for the development and review of appropriate gender strategies. Loan covenants have helped to keep

gender equality issues on the agenda when internal stakeholder commitment and ownership is weak or mixed. However, if they are to be useful, it is also important for covenants to be directly linked to key gender strategies.

While TLDP's GAP was not covered by a loan assurance, its "living," flexible approach was important for improving benefits and for successful mainstreaming. Mandatory, realistic targets are also essential and have assisted in delivering benefits to women in TEP (through scholarship awards). Progress toward equal access to project resources and benefits in TLDP is slower where targets have not been set and when no sex-disaggregated data have been collected.

All three projects and executing agencies need to improve monitoring of participation and benefits, including the collection and reporting of sex-disaggregated data. Project logical frameworks give inadequate attention to gender-sensitive indicators. This increases the risk that differences between women's and men's participation and benefits will be poorly monitored. ADB loan review missions also need to systematically collect and record sex-disaggregated data wherever possible. Without such data it is difficult to analyze participation and benefits and to demonstrate the links between gender provisions and overall project objectives. Another important challenge is to move beyond monitoring gender balance and participation to monitoring and assessing results and outcomes such as changes in gender relations.

## **5. Capacity for Gender-Sensitive Development in Executing Agencies**

Capacity building using routine management forums and special gender training events was a strong feature in TLDP's success and enhances the likelihood of positive benefits in TEP. The use of NGOs with demonstrated experience in community mobilization and gender sensitization also enhanced TLDP's success as did the participation of the local gender specialist in the executing agency.

### **D. The Role of Local Gender Specialists**

Findings suggest that the ADB resident mission gender specialist should be closely involved in both the design and implementation of key projects, particularly where ownership and capacity to develop appropriate gender strategies are limited. In both TLDP and GRP, the involvement of the specialist has been critical for ensuring that gender equality issues were addressed.

In-house capacity in the executing agency also allows the resident mission gender specialist to support and facilitate a number of projects. In TLDP, capacity was significantly enhanced by the appointment of a local gender specialist in the Department of Livestock Services who was assigned to work with stakeholders at many different levels. This compares with the experience in GRP where gender focal points have been appointed but have unclear roles, limited capacity, and inadequate resources.

**E. Other External and Institutional Factors**

Institutional and social factors have also played their parts in both supporting and constraining results for women. Support and pressure for gender equality from donors and civil society has been an important factor in the success achieved in GRP to date. On the other hand, the lack of high-level consensus on ways to implement gender policy commitments has been a constraining factor. The development of further gender strategies for GRP needs to draw on and strengthen a coalition of internal and external support. In TEP, the overall policy framework is favorable, and more detailed gender strategies need to be devised within the institutional framework of EFA.

In TLDP, committed, stable leadership and good management practices in DLS have been key reasons for success. Project management (including the development and implementation of gender strategies) has been characterized by teamwork, good communication strategies and patterns, support from the project leadership for the TLDP gender specialist to undertake her role, encouragement for all staff to reflect on strengths and shortcomings, and a capacity to learn from experience and adapt strategies to improve project outcomes.

## *Chapter 6*

# Conclusion

Findings demonstrate that TLDP's GAP was an effective tool for promoting and ensuring more systematic attention to gender issues.

- The GAP contributed to significant increases in women's participation and access to project resources which resulted in improved practical benefits. There is evidence that strategic changes in gender relations are also beginning to take place.
- The GAP increased effectiveness in achieving poverty reduction and the likelihood that benefits will be sustained.
- It strengthened commitment to institutionalize gender-mainstreaming approaches due to the positive results for women and the poor.
- It also facilitated replication of successful strategies across the sector by the executing agency.

TEP demonstrates the importance of revisiting gender design strategies early on during implementation to ensure that a comprehensive project GAP is developed to maximize benefits from the loan investment. The use of loan conditions in GRP is a good practice example that has significant potential to promote and reinforce strategic changes toward gender equality. Delays in implementation demonstrate the need for consistent and systematic follow-up by ADB to ensure that policies are implemented.

All three projects and executing agencies share common weaknesses that need to be addressed in the design and implementation of loans.

- Project frameworks have very few gender sensitive indicators. They are necessary to ensure that differences in participation and benefits between women and men are monitored.
- Where gender strategies and provisions are included in the loan design, they are not adequately or systematically reflected in project frameworks.
- Monitoring of participation and benefits should be improved. This requires the systematic collection, reporting, and analysis of sex-disaggregated data in all project components.
- ADB loan review missions should play a greater role in investigating and analyzing differences in participation and benefits between men and women.

Lessons and findings from the Nepal RGA are confirmed and reinforced by the RGAs in Bangladesh, Cambodia, and Pakistan. These include the following.

- ⇒ GAs should be prepared for projects and incorporated in the loan designs to provide a road map for executing agencies and project teams during implementation.
- ⇒ Gender strategies and plans need to have quantifiable targets and strategies for each component, including gender sensitive monitoring indicators integrated into project frameworks.
- ⇒ Gender strategies need to be reviewed early during implementation to develop a more detailed GA.
- ⇒ GAs should be owned by the executing agency and implementing teams and should clearly specify responsibilities for implementation.
- ⇒ When the GA is developed, key project team members and other stakeholders (such as nongovernment organizations) must understand gender provisions and their rationale including how they assist in implementing the overall loan objectives.
- ⇒ Reviewing gender design strategies during implementation may also be a way of building gender mainstreaming capacity within the executing agency and project team and of ensuring that the GA is owned by all stakeholders.
- ⇒ Local gender specialists are needed on project teams to oversee GA implementation and to provide ongoing gender capacity building.

The importance of ownership is well demonstrated in all three loans in Nepal. Where ownership is strongest, the most comprehensive benefits and results are demonstrated. It is also clear that solid achievements in gender equality and poverty reduction reinforce executing agency ownership and support.

The RGAs in all four countries demonstrate that involvement of the ADB resident mission gender specialist is critical for improving loan design and implementation. The appointment of gender specialists to project teams and executing agencies and adequate resources for GAs to ensure that there is ongoing capacity building are also common factors for success among the four countries.

## APPENDIX 1: SUMMARIES OF GENDER-RELATED PROVISIONS AND RESULTS

**Table 1: Gender Strategies, Provisions, and Gender Equality Results for the Third Livestock Development Project (TLDP)**

Project Component	Gender Strategies in the Gender Action Plan <sup>73</sup>	Gender Equality Results <sup>74</sup>
Project goal is to reduce poverty	Goal includes a special mention of the need to target farmers and resource-poor rural people, especially women.	There is evidence that the project is reducing poverty by targeting women, particularly for small livestock activities (pigs, goats, and poultry). Based on a sample of 50 households in Bhuwanpokheri of Palpa, one partner nongovernment organization (NGO) estimates women are now earning up to NRs 4,000 per year from the sale of goats. <sup>75</sup> This was confirmed by the Devdaha women's goat group who report earning Rs 3,000 – 4,000 per year.
<b>1. Livestock Productivity Improvement</b>		
Expansion of forage and feed production	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● TLDP pocket packages are targeted to groups formed by District Women Development officers and partner NGOs, as well as groups formed by District Livestock Service Office (DLSO) staff. Most livestock enterprise groups receive a full package of technical support.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Women receive assistance with forage production as members of livestock groups. E.g. in Palpa district, women are 53% of direct beneficiaries from forage development activities.<sup>76</sup></li> <li>■ A meeting with DLSO, NGOs, livestock action team members (LAT), women development officers (WDO) and a chair of a women's group in Palpa district concluded that overall, women's workload has decreased because fodder is now found nearby. In some cases adult males are also involved in collecting fodder.</li> </ul>

<sup>73</sup> Based on TLDP reports of Gender Awareness in Livestock Development workshops and case studies which document the gender action plan.

<sup>74</sup> Based on document review, interviews with project staff in Kathmandu and during field visits, including meetings with women's groups and 1 livestock action team.

<sup>75</sup> Sherchand, Laxman and Ava Shrestha. 2004. "Third Livestock Development Project Gender Mainstreaming Experiences, Nepal" PowerPoint presentation.

<sup>76</sup> Bhandari, Tulsi Ram 2003: 9.

Project Component	Gender Strategies in the Gender Action Plan	Gender Equality Results
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Formation of all-male groups was discontinued after the mid-term review with an increased focus on mixed male-female and all-female groups.</li> </ul>	
Pasture seed production	As above, most livestock enterprise groups receive a full package of technical support.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Some women's groups (too poor to own livestock) now earn money from seed and pasture production. Their income compared to livestock groups is not known.</li> </ul>
Animal health and breeding	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● As above, most livestock enterprise groups receive a full package of technical support.</li> <li>● Village animal health worker training (VAHW) for women was recommended in the 2<sup>nd</sup> TLDP workshop on gender awareness in livestock development.<sup>77</sup></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ No women have been trained as para-vets (30 males trained).</li> <li>■ 439 VAHWs are registered with the project. Sex-disaggregated data on trained and working VAHWs is not routinely reported. In Palpa district, 35 women out of a total 252 people (14%) have been trained as VAHWs, but only 9 women and 19 men are active as VAHWs.</li> </ul>
Credit	Partnerships with NGOs and other participating financial institutions were designed to facilitate access to up to NRs 30,000 credit per women's group using the group guarantee as collateral.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ At 31 March 2004, NRs 211 million had been distributed to 7,088 farmers.<sup>78</sup> Sex-disaggregated data on access to credit is not routinely monitored. Credit is used for larger livestock (cattle and buffalo) and requires collateral. Since most land and houses are registered in men's names, only men have access to formal lending institutions.</li> <li>■ Women in Palpa district have not been able to access any TLDP credit because Nepal Rastra Bank would not approve loans using group collateral.</li> </ul>

<sup>77</sup> Karki, Rukmini 2001 and Rukmini Karki 2002.

<sup>78</sup> TLDP 2004 *Progress Report No. 20*.

Project Component	Gender Strategies in the Gender Action Plan	Gender Equality Results
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Women can access loans from their own group savings/welfare funds for school fees, health costs, consumption and small enterprise development (up to Rs 3,500 per loan in the Devdaha women's group). Some NGOs are also able to access other sources of non-bank credit for women using group collateral.</li> </ul>
<b>2. Agroprocessing and Marketing</b>		
Training for small-scale agro-processing and marketing	Women's participation in on-site and regional training was recommended during TLDP workshops on gender awareness in livestock development.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ 17 women (8% of 206) have been trained to date in meat production and processing; 10 women (14% of 72) have undertaken butcher's training; and 135 women (12% of 1130) have been trained in milk processing and marketing.<sup>79</sup></li> <li>■ Women's share in agroprocessing could not be verified due to limited time in the field but appears to be relatively minor overall compared with men's. Project staff confirmed low levels of utilization of training by women in dairy and meat enterprises compared with an estimated 65% utilization of training in dairy processing by men and almost 100% utilization by men of meat processing and marketing training (because this has been targeted to male butchers/shopkeepers).</li> <li>■ One case study notes that women's share in agroprocessing varies from district to district depending on the types of activities undertaken. Stakeholders note that before participation in TLDP, women would rarely be consulted about decisions that involved a lot of money whereas now women are more likely to be consulted. Further investigation is needed on strategies for increasing women's role in agroprocessing.</li> </ul>

<sup>79</sup> TLDP. 2004. *Progress Report* Op. cit.

Project Component	Gender Strategies in the Gender Action Plan	Gender Equality Results
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Women retain control over goat and poultry income. Marketing is generally at the farm gate. However, women who have been trained are actively involved in selling meat at livestock stalls set up with TLDP assistance.</li> </ul>
<b>3. Institutional Strengthening and Organizational Development</b>		
Livestock action teams	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Training to project staff and LATs to increase awareness of women’s central contribution to the livestock sector, and the link between addressing gender issues and achieving overall project objectives.</li> <li>● District WDO, included on LATs as core members.</li> <li>● Encouragement of female farmer and NGO representatives to participate in livestock planning through district LATs.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ There is increased participation of women in livestock planning and management at the district level: 14/19 LATs (74%) include 1 female member (the district WDO); 4/19 LATs (21%) have 2 female members (the WDO and 1 female farmer’s representative); and 1/19 (5%) has 3 female members (the WDO, 1 female farmers’ representative, and 1 NGO representative).<sup>80</sup></li> <li>■ Women’s groups already established by WDOs have been targeted by TLDP increasing the effective utilization of project resources.</li> </ul>

<sup>80</sup> TLDP. 2004. *Progress Report* Op. cit. 32-38.

Project Component	Gender Strategies in the Gender Action Plan	Gender Equality Results
Establishment and training of farmer groups, community based organizations (CBOs) and livestock industry related associations (LIRAs)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Discontinuation of the establishment of male-only groups after the mid-term review.</li> <li>● Revised target (in line with Ministry of Agriculture and Co-operatives directives) for at least 35% women's participation in livestock activities, including in mixed farmer groups.</li> <li>● Following the mid-term review, NGO partners were contracted to assist with community mobilization, including the involvement of women. NGO selection criteria include experience in community mobilization and</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Overall female representation in all types of farmer groups increased from 26% before the mid-term review to 44% in 2003. Female participation rose to 51% in 2004 due to a special poverty alleviation program using goat groups exclusively targeted at disadvantaged and ex-bonded women.<sup>81</sup></li> <li>■ In March 2004, 16% of TLDP's 1,395 farmer groups were male only, 44% were female only and 41% were mixed. Female representation is highest in goat (77%), poultry (66%), and pig (56%) enterprise groups and lowest in cattle (14%) and buffalo (24%) enterprise groups.<sup>83</sup></li> <li>■ Women's representation on the executive committee of CBOs is 44%. Project staff report that women are also represented on LIRAs, but sex-disaggregated data are not routinely reported on this.<sup>84</sup></li> <li>■ Women's participation in on-site training is reported as 44%, compared with 35% participation for training conducted outside the village.<sup>85</sup> Sex-disaggregated data on farmer training are not routinely reported by TLDP.</li> </ul>

<sup>81</sup> ANZDEC. 2004. *Technical Assistance Completion Report* and TLDP. 2004. Progress Report Op. cit.

<sup>82</sup> Sherchand, Laxman and Ava Shrestha. 2004. Op. cit.

<sup>83</sup> TLDP. 2004. *Progress Report* Op. cit.

<sup>84</sup> Sherchand, Laxman and Ava Shrestha. 2004. Op. cit. and interviews with TLDP project staff. In Rupandehi, it was reported that executive committees of mixed male/female CBOs are dominated by males.

<sup>85</sup> Sherchand, Laxman and Ava Shrestha. 2004. Op. cit.

Project Component	Gender Strategies in the Gender Action Plan	Gender Equality Results
	gender sensitization and women members on the executive committee of the NGO. <sup>82</sup>	
Project management, monitoring and evaluation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● 2 development facilitators (1 male and 1 female with 1 female only from 2001) were hired to provide training and support to project staff and LATs on gender sensitization and social mobilization and to provide leadership training for women.</li> <li>● Project staff to be made aware of gender disparities in access to project benefits through training seminars, management meetings, and other forums.</li> <li>● TLDP's gender action plan to form the basis of an overall gender and development strategy for the Department of Livestock Services (DLS).</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Staff and LAT members have received gender training. TLDP staff report that there is now greater recognition of female farmers as key stakeholders in livestock production and better understanding of links between technical and social inputs.</li> <li>■ Data on leadership training for women is not routinely reported by TLDP nor is the participation of female staff in project-related training. Of 148 project staff and entrepreneurs to receive overseas training, 8% have been women.<sup>86</sup></li> <li>■ Project staff report that TLDP gender strategies are more likely to be applied to DLS's overall work (e.g. targeting women farmers, focus on small ruminants, and social mobilization activities).</li> <li>■ TLDP lessons learned have been incorporated into the design of the Community Livestock Development Project.</li> </ul>

<sup>86</sup> TLDP. 2004. *Progress Report* Op. cit.

**Table 2: Gender Provisions and Progress toward Gender Equality Results for the Governance Reform Program (GRP)**

Project Component	Gender Provisions in Loan Design <sup>87</sup>	Progress toward Gender Equality Results <sup>88</sup>
<b>Project goal</b>	To establish a civil service that is more results- and people-oriented and gender responsive.	The GRP has the potential to address gender issues in many areas, but it is too early to assess results due to delayed implementation.
<b>1. Develop an Internal Capacity for Leading Reform</b>		
Governance Reform and Coordination Unit (GRCU) to conduct stakeholder consultations to refine the scope of GRP		Ministry of Women, Children and Social Welfare (MOWCSW) was included in stakeholder consultations during loan preparation and design. A number of workshops have been dedicated to discussing approaches to addressing gender issues, the most recent in January 2004, initiated by Ministry of General Administration (MOGA) and including participation from line ministries and donors (ADB, World Bank, United Nations Development Programme, and Department for International Development).
Establish a ministerial (ARCMC) and executive committee (ARC) to manage and coordinate reforms		Committees have been established. While the environment for increasing women’s representation in the civil service is improving, consensus on what actions are to be taken to promote greater gender equality is lacking. The government’s road map for reform retains most of the gender sensitive language and commitments included in the Report and Recommendation of the President (RRP). However, the slow pace of implementation indicates the lack of a clear commitment to actively reduce disparities.

<sup>87</sup> Based on RRP: NEP 32238 and Shrestha, Ava Governance Reform Program Loan (2001–2005) PowerPoint presentation.

<sup>88</sup> Based on document review and interviews with project stakeholders during the rapid gender assessment.

Project Component	Gender Provisions in the Loan Design	Progress toward Gender Equality Results
Establish GRCU at MOGA, efficiency unit at MOF and change units in Ministry of Agriculture and Co-operatives (MOAC), Ministry of Education and Sports (MOES) and Ministry of Health (MOH)	<p>Gender focal point to be established in each of the 5 units for mainstreaming the participation of women in government and in the GRP:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● MOGA and MOF to establish gender focal points as a tranche two condition</li> <li>● MOES, MOH and MOAC to establish gender focal points as a tranche three condition</li> </ul>	<p>Requirements of the policy matrix have been exceeded by identifying gender focal points in all five ministries, including a gender unit in MOGA.<sup>89</sup> Stakeholders agree that gender focal points lack adequate resources and guidelines to fulfill their roles. Some stakeholders see them as lacking capacity and commitment (due to inadequate training, frequent transfers, and the fact that some gender focal points do not choose their positions). Others focus on the inability of gender focal points to intervene in decision making at policy and program levels due to lack of seniority and because ministries do not encourage this type of input. Monthly meetings of gender focal points do not appear to have taken place.<sup>90</sup> The road map requires each change unit to include one woman.<sup>91</sup></p>
Five units above prepare and implement annual plans	GRCU to prepare gender sensitive reform plans for approval on an annual basis.	The road map requires each change unit to prepare an annual program/plan for governance reform, but does not note the need for this program to be gender sensitive. <sup>92</sup>

<sup>89</sup> According to MOWCSW, gender focal points exist in 26 line ministries: 10 are at Class III level (the lowest level for a gazetted civil servant) and the remainder are at Under-Secretary level (gazetted class II civil servants). There is also a division in MOAC dedicated to women and agriculture which pre-dates the GRP.

<sup>90</sup> Monthly meetings were agreed as a follow-up action during the February 2003 ADB loan review mission (ADB. 2004. Aide-Memoire of Loan Review Mission: 15).

<sup>91</sup> MOGA. 2003. *Road Map of Reform Programs to be Implemented under the Governance Reform Program*.

<sup>92</sup> Ibid.

<b>Project Component</b>	<b>Gender Provisions in the Loan Design</b>	<b>Progress toward Gender Equality Results</b>
Executive committee to prepare an annual public report	Annual public report to include information on women	The report has been completed and includes information on the number of women in the civil service.
GRCU to work with civil society organizations for public dissemination and feedback		<p>The Civil Society Support Project (CSSP) was established in July 2003 through the NGO Pro Public using funds from Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation. Of eight staff appointed, three are women. All civil society organizations have been advised of the need for gender balance in sending participants to workshops which orient and establish citizen monitoring cells (CMCs), and in the CMCs themselves.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Of 6 CMCs established to date with a total of 112 voluntary members, 18 (16%) are women. A meeting with Kavre CMC suggests that CMCs need further guidance to ensure that women become actively involved and that gender issues are properly addressed in local advocacy and monitoring of GRP.</li> <li>■ CCSP has produced two posters that illustrate rights and responsibilities for accessing government services. These are very gender sensitive showing women and men in positive, active, decision making roles.</li> </ul>
Independent agency to monitor GRP implementation and publicize its reviews		Pro Public has produced its first report which assesses progress according to the policy matrix included in the RRP including gender provisions identified in the matrix. However, where outputs are required to be gender sensitive, there is not always an assessment of this in the report.

Project Component	Gender Provisions in the Loan Design	Progress toward Gender Equality Results
<b>2. Improve the Efficiency of the Civil Service</b>		
Revised voluntary retirement scheme		2,100 civil servants have taken voluntary retirement to date; 10-12 of these have been women. <sup>93</sup>
Policy paper and plans on rightsizing government and devolution of functions: by efficiency unit of MOF and by change units of MOAC, MOES and MOH	<p>Policy to ensure that rightsizing will lead to narrowing the gap between the number of male and female civil servants</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Policy paper of MOF efficiency unit will be based on past technical assistance and will be gender sensitive</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ It has not been possible to assess whether rightsizing policies and plans will lead to a narrowing of the gap between the number of male and female civil servants.</li> <li>■ The government's road map does not include a commitment to narrow the gap between the number of male and female civil servants in its planned activities on rightsizing.<sup>94</sup></li> </ul>
Policy and measures to increase efficiency in the teacher service	Efficiency unit, GRCU, and MOES change unit to prepare policy paper (on teacher recruitment, remuneration and number of posts) that is gender sensitive	Education act, 7 <sup>th</sup> Amendment 2002 has been approved but was not assessed. MOES' teacher training policy addresses gender issues satisfactorily (for example, by including provisions for increasing opportunities for women and disadvantaged groups to enter the teaching profession (see TEP Table 3 below).
Computerized personnel records		All information is sex-disaggregated. Previously, a wife's name would not be entered, and pension/benefits would go to a male. This has now been rectified.

<sup>93</sup> Figures provided during interview with the cabinet secretary, 25/5/2004.

<sup>94</sup> MOGA. 2003. Op. cit.

Project Component	Gender Provisions in the Loan Design	Progress toward Gender Equality Results
<b>3. Improve Governance and Reduce Corruption in Government</b>		
Legislation on audit of funds of political parties; declaration of property, assets, and income; anti-corruption, whistleblower protection and anti-money laundering		No gender issues have been identified in these areas.
CIAA, anti-corruption court and anti-corruption unit		No gender issues have been identified in these areas.
<b>4. Enhance the Competence and Motivation of Civil Servants</b>		
Affirmative action policy and program to increase representation of women in the civil service including their percentage in senior positions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Included in the RRP policy matrix as a condition for the release of tranche two.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ The road map proposes amending the law to reserve 20% of vacant new-entry posts for 5 years for women, 10% for oppressed classes and 10% for ethnic communities. The former Prime Minister announced that this would be effective from April 2004, but this has been impossible with no sitting parliament. There is significant disagreement among stakeholders about how to implement this proposal, and whether reservation (as distinct from targets) is the best way forward. The road map also plans for additional approved posts in all ministries to appoint one woman each to one class I and class II posts, by lateral entry, which will also require amendments to the civil service act.</li> </ul>

Project Component	Gender Provisions in the Loan Design	Progress toward Gender Equality Results
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● MOGA and MOWCSW to introduce appropriate nonmonetary benefits and procedures to increase representation of women in the civil service and address other gender issues. (Included as a tranche two milestone in the RRP policy matrix.)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Following the RGA, cabinet approved a reservation policy for women, <i>janjatis</i> and <i>dalits</i> for 5 years for entry to the civil service and other government authorities, including 1 high-level post in <u>either</u> class I or class II. The policy does not identify the exact percentage of places to be reserved but notes that seats will be reserved in teaching and local bodies such as district and village development committees.<sup>95</sup></li> <li>■ Currently there are 3 separate but simultaneous processes investigating ways to mainstream gender equality: a high-level reservation committee chaired by the MOF; the appointment of an expert by MOGA using government funds to provide a proposal on how to move forward on all aspects of gender mainstreaming in GRP (report due in June); and the work of a DFID consultant team on affirmative action in the civil service.</li> <li>■ A number of nonmonetary benefits were introduced in 1998 but some stakeholders believe these have had little impact.<sup>96</sup> The road map proposes additional</li> </ul>

<sup>95</sup> Acharya, Yuvhav “Cabinet Okays Governance Reform Package” (*Kathmandu Post*) 24<sup>th</sup> September 2004.

<sup>96</sup> Nonmonetary benefits introduced in 1998 include raising the age bar for civil service entry to 40 for women (compared to 35 for men); a probationary period prior to permanent appointment of 6 months for women (1 year for men); placement of spouses in the same district; and a 1-year advantage to women regarding the minimum period of service required eligibility for promotion (Dhungel not dated *Engendering Nepalese Civil Service*).

Project Component	Gender Provisions in the Loan Design	Progress toward Gender Equality Results
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● MOF to provide necessary funds to organize coaching classes for women to prepare for the civil service entry examinations for gazetted class III officers and GRCU to monitor implementation</li> </ul>	<p>nonmonetary benefits.<sup>97</sup> The MOGA consultant report due in June is expected to report on further measures needed to create a favorable environment for women in the civil service. A cabinet decision in September 2004 after the rapid gender assessment (RGA) notes that a model childcare center will be established in Kathmandu and that 11 days paternity leave will be granted to men up to two times during their careers.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Coaching programs to date have not resulted in any significant improvement in the number of women passing the civil service entry examination.<sup>98</sup></li> <li>■ However, in the most recent course (2003/2004), 178 graduates attended coaching for the preliminary screening exam, and 95 (53%) passed. 176 women have attended coaching for the civil service entry exam, but their results are not available yet. Another 33 women were coached for Joint Secretary and Under Secretary exams. One of these women passed in the technical category and others are waiting for their results.<sup>99</sup></li> </ul>

<sup>97</sup> MOGA. 2003. Op. cit. 9–10. Additional measures proposed in the road map include ensuring that recipients of annual civil service awards include women; granting scholarships to women on a priority basis; establishing childcare centers; increases to maternity leave; flexible working hours; and further amendments to the age limit for entering the civil service for gazetted class I and II posts for women working in corporations and universities.

<sup>98</sup> ADB 2004 “Loan 1861: Op. cit.” and Dhungel Op. cit.

<sup>99</sup> Interview with MOWCSW 2/6/2004.

Project Component	Gender Provisions in the Loan Design	Progress toward Gender Equality Results
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● MOGA to review annual progress on increased representation of women</li>   <li>● MOGA to issue a directive to line ministries to include women in civil service staff development training</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ MOWCSW and MOGA have jointly undertaken “interaction” programs with university graduates in several towns to promote the civil service as a career option for women and to inform them of how and when to apply. This has resulted in increased interest by women in joining the civil service and will be continued.</li>   <li>■ The total percentage of women in the civil service has increased slightly (from 8.55% in 2001 to 9.16% in 2004) but the percentage of women at decision-making levels has decreased from 4.02–1.79% (see table below).</li>   <li>■ The road map indicates that women development officers will be “regularized” as permanent civil service positions, and this was done recently by the cabinet. However, no consensus has yet been reached on how to do this. Most stakeholders were in favor of keeping the current staff many of whom are over 40 years (the maximum age for entry to the public service), and many of whom have served in their positions for around 20 years.</li>   <li>■ According to the RRP, this directive has been issued, but it is not possible to verify the percentage of women and men who have received training compared with those eligible for training.</li> </ul>

Project Component	Gender Provisions in the Loan Design	Progress toward Gender Equality Results
New salary structure approved		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ No new salary structure has been proposed or approved to date, so it is not possible to assess gender equality impacts</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Amendments to civil service act to improve efficiency and effectiveness, with specific attention to gender</li> <li>● Nepal Administration Staff College (NASC) training</li> <li>● Procedures to strengthen personnel assessments</li> <li>● Merit-based approach to recruitment and promotion</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● GRCU and NASC to revise curriculum and duration of formal training courses for induction and improved management development and include training on anticorruption legislation, personnel assessment, and gender issues</li> <li>● GRCU to establish a gender sensitive, merit-based approach to recruitment and promotion</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ NASC and other stakeholders report that NASC has now mainstreamed gender issues within its curricula, in addition to appointing two women onto the NASC board.</li> <li>■ Little action appears to have been taken on personnel assessment, human resources succession planning, and grievance procedures.<sup>100</sup> Interviews suggest that some stakeholders see these types of processes as gender neutral and do not see a need for gender issues to be considered or addressed.<sup>101</sup></li> <li>■ There are significant differences of opinion regarding the nature of the current public service commission (PSC) examination system and whether or not it is gender neutral. The road map indicates that the curriculum of the PSC will be improved to make it gender friendly by the end of the 2005 fiscal year (and there is a task group working on this), but no action has been taken yet. Some government stakeholders strongly assert that the civil service already has a merit based approach to recruitment</li> </ul>

<sup>100</sup> ADB. 2004. Loan 1861. Op. cit. and CCSP. 2004. *Progress Monitoring of the Governance Reform Program of HMG/N*. A GRP task group is currently working on these areas.

<sup>101</sup> However, the possibility of sexual harassment was raised in two technical assistance reports in relation to grievance procedures and promotion systems (ADB. 2003. *Institutional Support for Governance Reform: ISCR Final Report* and ADB. 2002. *Institutional Support for Governance Reform: Gender Mainstreaming*. However, one senior official asserted that sexual harassment is an imported cultural concept although he agreed that it is unacceptable if it does occur.

Project Component	Gender Provisions in the Loan Design	Progress toward Gender Equality Results
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Human resources succession plan for senior positions</li> <li>● Procedures and process for handling grievance issues</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● GRCU to review and prepare new approaches to procedures and processes for handling grievance issues that are also sensitive to women</li> </ul>	<p>and promotion, whereas others highlight the exclusion of women, disadvantaged and ethnic groups as a key area requiring reform. These people assert that the current examination system is mechanistic and memory-based rather than analytical, that there should be a more flexible approach to the language which applicants can use in the exam, and that the examination for gazetted class III officers is biased towards those who are already employed in the civil service as non-gazetted officers.</p>
<b>5. Establish Processes for Improving Performance in Key Ministries</b>		
<p>Performance management system, plans and new service standards for MOES, MOAC and MOH, including a performance incentive fund</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Implementation of this component of the GRP has barely begun so it is far too soon to assess progress towards results.<sup>102</sup></li> <li>■ This component is critical for ensuring that the governance reform process results in equal access to resources and benefits for both women and men from all social groups at the district level. Currently it is unclear whether key stakeholders see the relevance of gender issues for this component of the GRP.</li> </ul>

<sup>102</sup> An ADB-supported technical assistance on strengthening performance-based management was initiated from 1 March 2004 to facilitate the implementation of this component.

Project Component	Gender Provisions in the Loan Design	Progress Toward Gender Equality Results
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ The technical assistance report recommended that the performance management system include a budget and program for gender mainstreaming, but this has not been picked up in the government's road map.<sup>103</sup></li> </ul>
GRCU, MOF, MOAC, MOES and MOH with NASC to design, conduct and evaluate appropriate management and in-service training linked to ministry-based performance improvement plans		No progress has been made on this subcomponent.
MOGA to monitor and publicize results of annual service performance		This is too early to assess. However, with additional guidance it is possible that CMCs under CSSP could play a role in monitoring the performance of government agencies and staff in addressing the needs and priorities of both women and men.

<sup>103</sup> ADB. 2003. Op. cit.

**Table 3: Gender Provisions and Progress toward Gender Equality Results for the Teacher Education Project (TEP)**

Project Component	Gender Provisions in Loan Design <sup>104</sup>	Progress toward Gender Equality Results <sup>105</sup>
<b>Project Objectives</b> Goal is to improve the quality and efficiency of basic education through better qualified teachers	Improving access to primary schooling for girls and other disadvantaged groups is included as a specific objective.	Project implementation was slow in year 1. It is too early to assess impact. Programs for increasing girls' access are only just beginning to be formulated. Outcomes at this level will also depend on other donor-supported programs under the broad umbrella of the Education For All (EFA) strategy for 2004 to 2009. <sup>106</sup>
<b>1. Building an Effective and Sustainable System for Teacher Education</b>		
Provision of in-country and overseas training to staff of National Center for Education Development (NCED), Primary Teacher Training Center (PTTCs) and distance education center (DEC) in training techniques, curriculum and material development and management	Criteria for selecting NCED, PTTC and DEC candidates for international training shall include guidelines for encouraging eligible female candidates ( <i>covenanted</i> )	Criteria are in draft form. Sex-disaggregated data on staff development are not provided in NCED's Progress Report or the back-to-office report (BTOR) of the loan review mission. No targets were set for female participation in staff development and no training for this component has been undertaken yet. NCED has 21 staff (3 female, 14%); DEC has 34 staff (10 female, 29%); and 9 government PTTCs have 72 staff (6 female, 8%).

<sup>104</sup> From RRP: NEP 32236; and Project Administration Memorandum.

<sup>105</sup> Based on interviews with NCED and PTTC staff, meetings with teacher trainees, and project reports: TEP Progress Report for September-December 2003; BTOR of Loan Review Mission November 2003 and data provided by NCED by email on 9 June. Data provided by NCED by email gives different figures for training completed than the TEP Progress Report and the ADB BTOR. The emailed NCED data has been used here because it is sex disaggregated. The reason for these differences is not known.

<sup>106</sup> MOES. 2003. *Education For All 2004 – 2009 Core Document*.

Project Component	Gender Provisions in Loan Design	Progress toward Gender Equality Results
Infrastructure development for NCED (including hostel), PTTCs and DEC (studios)		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Plans for renovation of NCED have recently received ADB concurrence but have not been assessed directly. NCED has indicated that gender issues were discussed during the design and reports that there are adequate/almost equal provisions for toilets and accommodation</li> </ul>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ All PTTCs currently have boys' and girls' hostels, but only 2/9 PTTCs have female staff able to supervise girls' hostels.</li> </ul>
Strengthening the teacher management information system		NCED's progress report and ADB's BTOR for the loan review mission did not provide sex-disaggregated data for all types of training provided by NCED as part of the project.
Strengthening capacity to formulate and review teacher education policy		MOES's training policy gives satisfactory attention to gender and social equality issues. It includes provisions for increasing opportunities for women and disadvantaged groups to enter the teaching profession and to promote gender sensitive behavior by teachers. <sup>107</sup>
Provision of increased access to the services provided by NCED and PTTCs		Training of trainers (TOT) has been provided to 35 people, including 4 females (11%) from 15 teacher training providers.
Provision of TOT to 900 staff in selected training institutions including 9 PTTCs for in-service teacher training		TOT provided to 600 staff for every new training package. 15 (3%) of these trainees were women.

<sup>107</sup> MOES. 2004. (2061) Training Policy.

Project Component	Gender Provisions in Loan Design	Progress toward Gender Equality Results
<b>2. Develop Effective Teacher Education Curriculum and Materials</b>		
Overseas training to six DEC staff	Selection criteria to include guidelines for encouraging eligible female candidates ( <i>covenanted</i> )	Still at planning stage. Ministry of Finance (MOF) has not yet approved any international training for the project.
Development of TOT manuals, trainer's guides and resource materials for trainees to support the implementation of revised teacher training curricula	Culture and gender sensitization elements are to be incorporated into training curriculum for teachers and administrators. <sup>108</sup> (This is in addition to a special culture and gender sensitization package—see below.)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ A sample of three teacher training documents was assessed: Phase three Teacher's Guide (Nepali); the in-service curriculum for the 2<sup>nd</sup> phase (English); and the English section of Resource Materials for Trainees. Attention to gender equality issues in the English language materials is satisfactory. Some gender sensitive elements are included in the teacher's guide, but some opportunities for raising important gender issues are missed. For instance, in a discussion of agriculture, women's important roles and contributions could have been highlighted.</li> <li>■ Instructors report that about 1 day is spent on culture and gender sensitization issues in each teacher training package of 2.5 months, and that teacher trainers are able to bring in relevant examples from their own experiences.</li> <li>■ Elements of culture and gender sensitization sessions (described by a PTTC and NCED trainer) focus on how teaching behavior needs to change to ensure all students are treated equally, on the need to be aware of special problems facing girls and other disadvantaged students, on the need to hold parent meetings, on follow up when students drop out, and on how to undertake social awareness programs with students and parents.</li> </ul>

<sup>108</sup> RRP: NEP 32236.

Project Component	Gender Provisions in Loan Design	Progress toward Gender Equality Results
Development of a culture and gender sensitization training package	This is a gender-specific activity.	A 2-day training package has been developed based on a training needs analysis and a 2-day curriculum development workshop involving 2 women and 5 men. Female professors involved in women's education were involved in the development of the training package. Two TOT guides (Nepali) were assessed. Coverage of gender and cultural diversity issues is good in these guides and includes the law; Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW); efforts taken by the government to address gender inequity (including provisions in the government's 10 <sup>th</sup> Plan, EFA, TEP's component 4, and the ADB-assisted Secondary Education Sector Project); the reality of gender based discrimination in practice; and social exclusion based on caste, ethnicity, gender and language.
<b>3. Providing Teacher and Management Training</b>		
Basic in-service training to 32,000 primary school teachers		7,200 teachers have received this training. Sex-disaggregated data have been provided for 3567 teachers including 1676 females (47%).
Condensed basic training package to 9700 teachers		200 teachers are currently undertaking training but no sex-disaggregated data have been provided.
Integrated 2 <sup>nd</sup> and 3 <sup>rd</sup> package to 41,000 teachers by distance learning		7,000 teachers are currently undertaking training but no sex-disaggregated data have been provided.
3 <sup>rd</sup> in-service training package to 3,200 teachers		2,327 teachers have undertaken this training, including 709 females (30%).

Project Component	Gender Provisions in Loan Design	Progress toward Gender Equality Results
4 <sup>th</sup> in-service training package to 34,000 teachers		7,302 teachers have received this training, including 1,717 females (24%).
Condensed training to 4300 teachers over 50 years of age		No training undertaken yet.
Pre-service training to 15,000 teacher candidates		2,218 trainee teachers have received this training including 989 females (45%).
Management training to 600 officials and 3,000 school principals		284 officials including 30 females (11%) and 440 primary school principals including 30 females (7%) have received this training.
Establishment of mobile training units	Mobile training units will include at least one female trainer ( <i>covenanted</i> )	Interviews with NCED staff indicate that one woman is included in each mobile training unit.
<b>4. Serving Girls and Other Disadvantaged Groups</b>		
Provision of 2500 scholarships to teacher candidates from disadvantaged groups for pre-service teacher training	RRP notes that this will particularly target females; 75% females is a benefit indicator.	The first batch of 193 scholarships has been awarded to women from <i>dalit</i> (66%) and other disadvantaged groups from targeted districts for 10 months pre-service primary teacher training. Training began in February 2004. (This is a very positive target compared with the EFA target of 50 scholarships per year to females and <i>dalit</i> youth for pre-service teacher training.) <sup>109</sup>
Provision of training in culture and gender sensitization (in 12 targeted districts)	This is a gender-specific activity.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Training of 16 trainers (1 woman, 15 men), including 2 men from DEO and 14 from PTTCs has been done at central level.</li> </ul>

<sup>109</sup> MOES. 2003. *Education For All 2004 – 2009 Core Document*.

Project Component	Gender Provisions in Loan Design	Progress toward Gender Equality Results
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ NCED plans to conduct training in 7 districts targeting district education officers (DEOs), district development committees (DDCs), supervisors, line agencies, women development officers (WDOs) and others involved in women and <i>dalit</i> development efforts.</li> <li>■ The next step planned is to train 14 school support groups (SSGs, 2 x 7 districts) which will be established under the chair of school management committees (SMCs) in 2 schools each in 7 targeted disadvantaged districts.</li> </ul>
Girls' education promotion program	This is a gender-specific activity, which is not defined in detail in the RRP or project administration memo.	No activities have been undertaken to date. Plans include the establishment of SSGs in 14 schools (2 from each of 7 districts), and the provision of small financial support for their meetings and programs. Other plans are to be discussed during the next ADB loan review mission.
No specific component or activity	MOES to take all necessary measures to increase the number of female teachers and teachers from other disadvantaged groups by: priority recruitment of candidates from districts where vacancies are identified; and strict implementation of Education Regulations for each school to have at least 1 female teacher.	The RRP reports that there are about 3,000 primary teacher vacancies annually. <sup>110</sup> While the project provides for 2,500 pre-service training scholarships for women and disadvantaged groups, there is no guarantee that these female candidates will be appointed by SMCs. However, gender provisions included in the EFA program provide incentives for rural schools to employ 50% of either female or <i>dalit</i> teachers.

<sup>110</sup> RRP: NEP 32236.



**APPENDIX 2**  
**INTERVIEWS AND MEETINGS FOR**  
**NEPAL'S RAPID GENDER ASSESSMENT**  
**23 May – 7 June 2004**

Date	People Met	Loan
Mon 24 May	Arrival in Kathmandu <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr K.R. Panday, Sr Project Implementation Officer, NRM</li> <li>• Mr S.P. Shrestha, Sr Governance and Capacity Building Officer, NRM</li> </ul>	TEP GRP
Tuesday 25 May	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ms Rukmini Karki, previously Gender Specialist, TLDP</li> <li>• Mr G. Gewali, Project Implementation Officer, NRM</li> <li>• Ms. Gauri Devi Thapa, Junior Technician, TLDP</li> <li>• Dr L. Sherchand, Project Manager, TLDP</li> <li>• Dr B. Koirala, Chief Secretary, Cabinet Secretariat</li> <li>• Dr Sultan Hafeez Rahman, Country Director, NRM</li> </ul>	TLDP TLDP TLDP TLDP GRP All
Wed 26 May	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr K.P. Devkota, Project Manager, Civil Society Support Project</li> <li>• Mr A. Regmi, Under Secretary, Foreign Aid Coordination Division, Ministry of Finance</li> <li>• Mr M.K. Karki, Under Secretary, Foreign Aid Coordination Division, Ministry of Finance</li> <li>• Mr H.P. Panday, Section Officer, MOF</li> <li>• Mr R.P. Dahal, Section Officer, MOF</li> <li>• Mr N.K. Siwakoti, Section Officer, MOF</li> <li>• Mr G.J. Rayamajhi, Executive Director, Nepal Administrative Staff College</li> <li>• Dr Madan Manandhar, Director, Consulting Services Department, Nepal Administrative Staff College</li> <li>• Mr Hari P. Nepal, Director General, Department of Civil Personnel Records (<i>Kitab Khana</i>), MOGA</li> <li>• Ms Indu Pant Ghimire, National Program Manager, Mainstreaming Gender Equity Program, UNDP</li> <li>• Mr T.D. Niraula, Secretary, Ministry of General Administration</li> <li>• Mr S.P. Mainali, Joint Secretary/Program Manager, MOGA</li> </ul>	GRP All  All All All GRP GRP GRP GRP GRP GRP
Thurs 27 May	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr A.B. Bhandary, Director General, NCED</li> <li>• Mr S. Sapkota, Project Coordinator, NCED</li> <li>• Mr Indra B. Shrestha, Senior Instructor, Teacher Training Section, NCED</li> <li>• Mr Balakrishna Chapagain, Instructor, NCEC</li> <li>• Mr D.R. Pradhan, Deputy Director General, DLS (former Project Manager of TLDP)</li> </ul>	TEP TEP TEP  TEP TLDP

Friday 28 May	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ms Nirmala K.C., Monitoring Officer, Civil Society Support Project</li> <li>Mr Chandra Prakesh Lutel, Instructor, Kavre Primary Teacher Training Centre (PTTC)</li> <li>Mr Ram Subedi, Trainer, Kavre PTTC</li> <li>Mr Dinesh Shrestha, Instructor, Kavre PTTC</li> <li>Mr Bishwanath Karmscharya, Director, Kavre PTTC</li> <li>Meeting with approx 35 in-service teacher trainees, Kavre PTTC (50% women)</li> <li>Meeting with Citizen Monitoring Cell, Dhulikhel (1 woman, 5 men)</li> <li>Mr Nagendra P. Singh, Chief, private PTTC, Kathmandu</li> <li>Meeting with 13 female pre-service trainees, PTTC</li> </ul>	<p>GRP TEP</p> <p>TEP TEP TEP TEP</p> <p>GRP TEP TEP</p>
Sat 29 May	Document review	All
Sun 30 May	<p>Flight to Bhairahawa, Rupandehi district</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Dr Krishna Sankhi, Chief, DLSO, Bhairahawa</li> <li>Dr G. Uppadhay Assistant Veterinary Officer, DLSO, Bhairahawa</li> <li>Meeting with Devdaha Women's Goat Group, Rupandehi district (approximately 25 women and 3 men attending)</li> </ul>	<p>TLDP TLDP TLDP</p>
Mon 31 May	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Mr Tulsi Ram Bhandari, Chief, DLSO, Palpa</li> <li>Meeting with woman from Buffalo Group</li> <li>Visit to milk stalls</li> <li>Meeting with Lipindevi Women's Goat Group, Palpa district (approx 28 women &amp; 2 NGO representatives, 1 male)</li> <li>Meeting with Livestock Action Team and NGO representatives, Palpa DLSO including: Mr Ram Pokharel (Chair of local cooperative); Mr Gotame (<i>dalit</i> NGO representative); Mr A. Karki (NGO); Mr K. Parthi (Accountant, DLSO, Palpa); Ms Indira (WDO); Ms Shanti Nepal (NGO); Ms Gyawali (Chair, Kalika Women's Group); and 3 others (2 male, 1 female); and Mr Tulsi Ram Bhandari, and Mr G. Uppadhay</li> <li>Visit to Dairy Cooperative</li> </ul> <p>Flight to Kathmandu</p>	<p>TLDP TLDP TLDP</p> <p>TLDP</p> <p>TLDP</p>
Tues 1 June	Transport strike, appointments cancelled – document review	All
Wed 2 June	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Mr D.B. Thapa, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Population and Environment, formerly Project Manager, GRP</li> <li>Mr S.S. Sharma, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Women, Children and Social Welfare (MOWCSW)</li> <li>Mr S.R. Chowdhari, Under Secretary, MOWCSW</li> <li>Mr. K.K. Shrestha, Joint Secretary, MOAC</li> <li>Mr. A. Jha, Joint Secretary, MOAC</li> <li>Mr S. Adikhari, MOAC</li> </ul>	<p>GRP</p> <p>GRP</p> <p>GRP GRP GRP GRP</p>

Thurs 3 June	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr K.R. Panday, Sr Project Implementation Officer, NRM</li> <li>• Mr G. Gewali, Project Implementation Officer, NRM</li> <li>• Mr S. Sapkota, Project Coordinator, NCED (by phone)</li> </ul>	TEP TLDP TEP
Fri 4 June	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Ram Krishna Panth, Acting Secretary, Public Service Commission</li> <li>• Mr Ashish Joshi, Consultant, <i>Kitab Khana</i> (by phone)</li> </ul>	GRP GRP
Sat 5 June	Document review	
Sun 6 June	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Dr L. Sherchand, Project Manager, TLDP</li> <li>• Mr Purna B. Chemjong, TA Team Leader, TLDP</li> <li>• Mr Mandip Rai, Planning Officer, TLDP</li> </ul>	TLDP TLDP TLDP

**APPENDIX 3:  
TEACHER EDUCATION PROJECT**

**Public Primary Teachers in 12 Targeted Districts**

<b>District</b>	<b>2001 Male</b>	<b>2001 Female</b>	<b>2001 Female %</b>	<b>2001 Total</b>	<b>2002 Male</b>	<b>2002 Female</b>	<b>2002 Female %</b>	<b>2002 Total</b>
Bhojpur	1,007	216	18	1,223	1,034	203	16	1,237
Taplejung	812	161	17	973	841	188	18	1,029
Sunsari	964	211	18	1,175	987	411	29	1,398
Mahottari	862	179	17	1,041	881	166	16	1,047
Sindhu- palchok	1,090	162	13	1,252	1,143	175	13	1,318
Tanahun	1,467	567	28	2,034	1,363	520	28	1,883
Myagdi	506	174	26	680	579	208	26	787
Dang	926	333	26	1,259	1,311	378	22	1,689
Banke	617	115	16	732	656	214	25	870
Surkhet	674	193	22	867	992	228	19	1,220
Humla	249	39	14	288	261	43	14	304
Doti	574	130	18	704	778	147	16	925
<b>Total</b>	<b>9,748</b>	<b>2,480</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>12,228</b>	<b>10,826</b>	<b>2,881</b>	<b>21</b>	<b>13,707</b>

*Sources:*

- 2001 data is extracted from HMGN National Centre for Educational Development 2001 “Teacher Education Project – Benefit, Monitoring and Evaluation: Concepts and Baseline”: 33-34.
- 2001 data has been supplied by NCED by email, June 2004.

## APPENDIX 4:

### DOCUMENTS REVIEWED FOR NEPAL'S RAPID GENDER ASSESSMENT

#### Third Livestock Development Project

- Asian Development Bank 1996 “Proposed Loan - Third Livestock Development Project, R178-96 (RRP: NEP 25054)”.
- Asian Development Bank case study “Loan 1461-NEP: Third Livestock Development Project”.
- Asian Development Bank case study “Nepal Third Livestock Project (Midcourse Corrections to Safeguard Women as Project Beneficiaries)”.
- Ava Shrestha no date “Good Practice in Mainstreaming Gender in Project Implementation, Loan 1461-NEP: Third Livestock Development Project”.
- Laxman Sherchand and Ava Shrestha 2994 “Third Livestock Development Project: Gender Mainstreaming Experiences, Nepal, March 2004”, PowerPoint.
- Ava Shrestha 2003 “Community Livestock Development Project” September 2003, PowerPoint file
- ADB Nepal Resident Mission 2004 “Loan 1461-NEP: Third Livestock Development Project; TA 2851-NEP: Third Livestock Development Project; Back-to-Office Report (BTOR) of Review Mission” 15 January 2004.
- ANZDEC Limited 2004 “Nepal Third Livestock Development Project ADB TA 2851-NEP, Deputy Team Leader/Senior Development Facilitator TA Completion Report” Prepared for the Asian Development Bank, March 2004.
- Tulsi Ram Bhandari 2003 “Status Report of Third Livestock Development Project (TLDP) Activities in District Livestock Services Office (DLSO) Palpa” DLSO, Palpa.
- His Majesty's Government of Nepal, Ministry of Agriculture and Co-operatives, Department of Livestock Services 2004 “Third Livestock Development Project, ADB Loan No. 1461-NEP (SF) Quarterly Progress Report No. 20, December 1 2003 – March 31, 2004”.
- Rukmini Karki (editor) 2000 “Proceedings of the Workshop on ‘Gender Awareness in Livestock Development’” organized by Third Livestock Development Project (TLDP), Regional Project Management Office, Pokhara, May 28-29, 2000.
- Rukmini Karki (editor) 2001 “Proceedings of the Workshop on ‘Gender Awareness in Livestock Development’” organized by Third Livestock Development Project (TLDP), Regional Project Management Office, Pokhara, 4-5 March, 2001.
- Rukmini Karki (editor) 2002 “Proceedings of the Workshop on ‘Gender Awareness in Livestock Development’” organized by Regional Directorate of Livestock Services, Dipayal, Doti, 6 January, 2002.
- Rukmini Karki (no date) “Report on Women Participation in Livestock Development Activities in TLDP Districts” Third Livestock Development Project, Regional Project Management Office, Pokhara, His Majesty's Government of Nepal, Ministry of Agriculture and Co-operatives, Department of Livestock Services.

**Governance Reform Program**

- Asian Development Bank 2001 “Proposed Loan – Governance Reform Program, R206-01 (RRP: NEP 32238)”, November 2001.
- Asian Development Bank “Case Study: Nepal”, Ava Shrestha.
- Asian Development Bank “Governance Reform Program Loan (2001-2005)”, Ava Shrestha, PowerPoint.
- Asian Development Bank 2004 “Loan 1861: Governance Reform Program – Aide-Memoire of Loan Review Mission, 23 December 2003 – 8 January 2004”.
- Asian Development Bank 2002 “Institutional Support for Governance Reform: Gender Mainstreaming” Report by PDP Australia Pty Ltd for TA No. 3622-NEP to Kingdom of Nepal and ADB, November 2002.
- Asian Development Bank 2003 “Institutional Support for Governance Reform: ISCR Final Report” Report by PDP Australia Pty Ltd for TA No. 3622-NEP to Kingdom of Nepal and ADB, January 2003.
- CCSP (Civil Society Support Project) (2004) “Progress Monitoring of the Governance Reform Program of HMG/N” (Final Draft Report).
- Dhungel, Dwarika, N., Meena Acharya and Pradyumna Prasad Regmi (no date) *Engendering Nepalese Civil Service with Specific Reference to Promotion and Entry in Administrative Services* Mainstreaming Gender Equity Programme (NEP/97/005), UNDP.
- S. P. Mainali, Joint Secretary, Ministry of General Administration “Balancing Gender in the Nepalese Context”.
- Ministry of General Administration (no date, 2003) “Road Map of Reform Programs to be Implemented under the Governance Reform Program”.
- Ministry of Women, Children and Social Welfare (MOWCSW) 2004 “Social Mobilization and Gender Mainstreaming” Paper presented at the Pre Nepal Development Forum Consultation, March 2004.
- Nepal Administrative Staff College 2003 *Annual Report 2002 –2003*.
- Nepal Administrative Staff College, training brochures: “Senior Executive Development Programme 2003/2004”; “Training Workshop on Integration of Gender Perspectives in Planning and Monitoring/Evaluation for HMG/N Officers, February 5-12, 2003”; “Training Programme on Capacity Enhancement for Women Officials in Civil Service, 2060/11/15 – 2060/11/24, jointly organized by Mainstreaming Gender Equity Programme, UNDP”; “Advanced Course on Management and Development, 2003/2004”.
- Public Service Commission, Extracts of Data from PSC Annual Report 2058/2059.
- Yuvhaj Acharya 2004 “Cabinet okays governance reform package” in *Kathmandu Post* 24<sup>th</sup> September 2004.

**Teacher Education Project**

- Asian Development Bank 2001 “Proposed Loan - Teacher Education Project, R136-01 (RRP: NEP 32236)”, September 2001.
- Asian Development Bank, South Asia Department, Social Sectors Division 2003 “Loan 1840-NEP: Teacher Education Project (TEP) – Back-to-Office Report of the Loan Review Mission (22-28 November 2003)”.

- Asian Development Bank 2003 *Special Evaluation Study on the Government and Nongovernment Provision of Primary Education in Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Nepal* SST: STU 2003-05, January.
- Asian Development Bank 2002 “Project Administration Memorandum for the Loan to the Kingdom of Nepal for the Teacher Education Project [Loan 1840-NEP (SF)], Draft, May 2002.
- HMGN National Centre for Educational Development 2003 “Teacher Education Project, Benefit, Monitoring and Evaluation: Concepts and Baseline” July 2003.
- NCED “Loan No. 1840-NEP (SF): Teacher Education Project, Four-Month Period Progress Report, For the Period September-December 2003”
- Ministry of Education and Sports 2061 (2004) “Training Policy” Human Resource Development for Ministry of Education and Sports, Draft finalized by Council Sub Committee.
- Ministry of Education and Sports, National Centre for Educational Development 2000 *Primary Teacher Training Curriculum (In-service) Second Phase*.
- Ministry of Education and Sports, National Centre for Educational Development *Resource Materials for Trainees* (English Curriculum Section only).
- Ministry of Education and Sports 2003 “Education for All 2004 – 2009 Core Document” November 17, 2003.
- NCED “Gender and Cultural Awareness Training Program: Resource Material” (Nepali).
- NCED “Gender and Cultural Awareness Training Program: Manual for TOT” (Nepali).

#### **Other Documents**

- Asian Development Bank. 1998. *Policy on Gender and Development*.
- Asian Development Bank. 1999. *Country Briefing Paper: Women in Nepal* Asian Development Bank Programs Department West, Division 1.
- Asian Development Bank. 2001. “Gender Action Plan 2000-2003”, Office of Environment and Social Development, Social Development Division, October 2001.
- Asian Development Bank. 2001. *Special Evaluation Study on Gender and Development*, SST: STU 2001-13.
- Asian Development Bank. 2002. “Interim Progress Report on the Policy on Gender and Development.”
- Asian Development Bank. 2003. “RETA 5835 Enhancing Gender and Development Capacity in DMCs: Third Year Progress Report to DANIDA, 2002-2003.” Regional and Sustainable Development Department.